

Minutes of Meeting of Tender Evaluation Committee held @ 11.00 Hrs on 07.04.2021, for the services of

"Independent Engineer Services" during Operation & Maintenance period for 4-lane divided Carriageway of Ulundurpet - Padalur section of NH-45 from Km 192/750 to Km 285/000 & Padalur - Trichy section of NH-45 from Km 285/000 to Km 325/000 under NHDP Phase-III on BOT basis in the State of Tamil Nadu".

The Tender Evaluation Committee, constituted upon approval of the Regional Officer, Madurai has opened the bids @ 17:00 Hrs on 11.12.2020 and found that all the 4Nos. of bids are responsive based on pre-technical scrutiny. Later, the Detailed Technical Evaluation of Bids was taken up on 10.03.2021. The Initial scores assigned to the bidders are tabulated as under:

S. No	Name of the Bidder	Bid ID	Initial Scores Evaluated by NHAI
1	M/s Artefact Projects Ltd., Nagpur	223012	85.00
2	M/s. Feedback Infra Pvt. Ltd., Gurugram	223529	95.475
3	M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd., JV with Bloom Companies LLC in Association with M/s JR Consultancy Services Pvt. Ltd., Delhi.	223626	87.82
4	M/s MSV International Inc in association with MSV International Tech Pvt. Ltd., Gurugram.	223686	93.40

2. The evaluation sheets with the initial scores were circulated in Public Domain to receive objections from the bidders, if any, within a period of 07 days as per Para 5.3 (ii) of RFP. As the approved Minutes of Meeting along with annexure of Detailed Technical Evaluation sheets were uploaded in NHAI Public portal (www.nhai.org) on 17.03.2021, 07 days of time was considered until 23.03.2021. Accordingly, 4 numbers of bidders have furnished their objections/remarks towards the scores given against their technical bids.
3. Now, the Tender Evaluating Committee has examined the objections raised by the bidders and accordingly, the scores assigned were reviewed and following are brought out;
 - I. M/s Artefact Projects Ltd., Nagpur vide Letter No. APL/Tender/Ulundurpet-Trichy/2020-21/1263 dated 23.03.2021 has raised certain objections towards the initial evaluation. The details are as under;
 - (i) In hand DPRs for NHAI Projects: The bidder has requested to consider the aggregate length of all DPRs for evaluation.






In this regard, the Committee vide earlier Technical Minutes dated 10.03.2021 has already mentioned that, "In case of In hand DPRs for NHAI Projects, Bidders furnished LOAs and Agreement copies without mentioning length of Projects due to which the committee assigned marks based on longest project with supporting documents. Further, total length of the Projects in a Package has been considered as one unit while arriving at length of Project as per RFP." The same has clearly been mentioned in RFP as well. Hence, the request of Bidder cannot be considered thus summarily rejected.

- (ii) Senior Pavement Specialist: For this key personnel, the bidder has requested to consider the following;
- Post graduation in Transportation/ Highway Engineering/ Pavement Engineering
 - Experience in similar capacity on PPP Projects of (40% of Project Length i.e. 52.928 Km length of more) Similar configuration 4/6 laning** and above.
 - Employment with the firm

In this regard, the Evaluation Committee has re-evaluated the Technical bid and finalized the following;

- The Key Personnel's post-graduation (M.Tech in Highway and Transportation Engineering) has been accepted for consideration. Accordingly, 04 Marks will be assigned.
- Regarding Experience in Similar Capacity on PPP Projects, the Committee has considered the representation of bidder and revised the scores from 2.5 to 5.00 duly considering the experience in Sl. No. 4 in Infracon Portal subject to the condition to update the same in Infracon Portal by sending a request with supporting documents to the concerned in Infracon.
- Regarding Employment with the Firm, initially "0" marks were assigned. However, based on the representation of bidder and considering the experience certificate furnished by the bidder (1 year), the initial score has been revised to 3 Marks.
- In view of the above, the final scores of M/s Artefact Projects Ltd., Nagpur is listed as under:

S. No	Description	Max Marks	Self Evaluation	Initial Evaluation By NHAI	Final Evaluation by NHAI
1	Relevant experience for the assignment	35	29.25	23.5	23.5
2	Quality of approach and methodology	5	5	5	5
3	Experience in use of Technology for road inspection	20	20	20	20

S. No	Description	Max Marks	Self Evaluation	Initial Evaluation By NHAI	Final Evaluation by NHAI
4	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	40	36.97	36.50	36.97
Total		100	91.22	85.00	85.47

- II. M/s Feedback Infra Pvt. Ltd., Gurugram vide Letter No. FIPL/D/GEN/03-21/2211 dated 22.03.2021 has raised certain objections towards the initial evaluation w.r.t Key Personnel. The details are tabulated as under:

Table-I

Sl. No.	Position of Key Personnel	Representation from bidder
1.	Team Leader cum Highway Engineer	Requested to consider the Experience in Sl. No. 18 & 17 for "Team Leader/ Project Manager or in similar capacity" in O&M of completed 4/6 lane Highway sections (40% of Project Length or more of similar configuration (4/6 laning**) and above) and requested to revise the score from 30 to 35 Marks.
2.	Highway Maintenance cum Resident Engineer	Requested to consider the experience in Sl. No. 11, 8 & 4 in Infracon Portal for experience in similar capacity in Projects involving construction or maintenance works of 4/6 laning/expressways (40% of Project Length or more of similar configuration (4/6 laning**) and above) and requested to revise the score from 22.5 to 25 Marks.
3.	Bridge/Structural Engineer	Requested to consider the employment with the firm experience as 12 years [i.e. since October, 2007] and requested to revise the score from 0 to 5 Marks.
4.	Traffic and Transportation Expert	The bidder has represented to consider the listed Projects in Infracon regarding (ii) experience in similar capacity as Traffic & Transportation Expert/Traffic Engineer/Transportation Expert on Major Highway Project (40% of Project length i.e. 52.928 Km length or more) of similar configuration 4/6 laning** and above & (iv) Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety aspects during various phases of Highway Project and requested to revise the score.
5.	Sr. Pavement Specialist	The bidder has represented to consider Sl. No. 9,7,5&4 in Infracon Portal regarding (ii) experience in similar capacity as Pavement/Geo-Technical Engineer in Construction/construction supervision of Major Highway Projects (40% of Project length i.e. 52.928 Km length or more) of similar configuration 4/6 laning** and above, and accordingly requested to revise the score from 18 to 20 Marks.
6.	Sr. Quality cum Material Expert	The bidder has represented to consider Sl. No.7,6, 5&2 in Infracon Portal regarding (ii) experience in similar capacity in handling similar highway Projects(40% of Project length i.e. 52.928 Km length or more) of similar configuration 4/6 laning** and above, and accordingly requested to revise the score from 22 to 25 Marks.

Sl. No.	Position of Key Personnel	Representation from bidder
		Further, w.r.t employment with the firm, the bidder has requested to consider the experience listed in Infracon Portal i.e. since April, 2019 and accordingly to assign 3 Marks.

- (i) Regarding Team Leader cum Highway Engineer (Sl. No. 1 of above Table), the Committee has again reviewed the experience details and observed that, the Project in Sl. No. 18 has less than 40% of Project Length (<52.928 Km) and Project in Sl.No. 17 has already been considered and included in the initial evaluation itself. Thus, the initial score remains unchanged.
- (ii) Highway Maintenance cum Resident Engineer (Sl. No. 2 of Table-I): With reference to the details mentioned by the bidder, it is to mention that, Projects in Sl. No. 11 & 8 have already been considered and included in the initial evaluation itself. Further, Sl. No. 4 is not having more than 40% of Project Length (< 52.928 Km).As such, no change is necessitated.
- (iii) Bridge/Structural Engineer: For the key personnel mentioned in Sl. No. 3 of Table-I, the Committee has observed that, the score w.r.t. experience with firm was not claimed by the bidder in self-evaluation. However, now, based on the request of the bidder, experience has been considered duly reviewing the furnished experience details and thus the score revised to "5" from "0".
- (iv) Traffic & Transportation Expert/Traffic Engineer/Transportation Expert: Upon examining this representation as mentioned in Sl. No. 4 of Table-I, it is to mention that, the Committee has already evaluated the experience of the Key Personnel furnished in Infracon Portal duly following the provisions of RFP and accordingly the scores were assigned. Also, the bidder has not given any Project specific details/justification towards the additional marks, hence, the Committee has not considered the request of bidder and accordingly, there is no change is required in the scores assigned in initial evaluation.
- (v) Senior Pavement Specialist:The Committee has examined the Projects details (Sl. No. 9,7,5,4) mentioned w.r.t Sl. No. 5 of Table-I, and brought out that, Projects in Sl. No. 9 & 4 in Infracon: having less than 40% of Project Length (<52.928 Km) and Projects in Sl. No. 7 and 5 in Infracon: Same have already been considered and included in the initial evaluation itself.
- (vi) Senior Quality cum Material Expert: The Committee has examined the Projects details (Sl. No. 7,5,2 of Infracon) mentioned w.r.t Sl. No. 6 of Table-I and the same were already considered and included in the initial

evaluation itself. Also, Project in Sl. No. 6 of Infracon has less than 40% of Project Length (<52.928 Km) hence the same was not considered. Accordingly, the initial scores remain unchanged. However, w.r.t employment experience with the firm, the request of bidder has now been considered and the initial score has been revised to 3.

- (vii) In view of the above, the final scores of M/s Feedback Infra Pvt. Ltd., Gurugram is listed as under:

S. No	Description	Max Marks	Self Evaluation	Initial Evaluation By NHAI	Final Evaluation by NHAI
1	Relevant experience for the assignment	35	35	34	34
2	Quality of approach and methodology	5	5	5	5
3	Experience in use of Technology for road inspection	20	20	20	20
4	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	40	37.95	36.475	36.825
Total		100	97.95	95.475	95.825

III. M/sTechnocrats Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd., JV with Bloom Companies LLC in Association with M/s JR Consultancy Services Pvt. Ltd., Delhivide Lr. No. TASPL/NHAI/TN/O&M/Ulundurpet-Trichy/2020-21/975 dated 22.03.2021 has raised the following Objections;

- (i) **In hand DPRs for NHAI Projects:** The bidder has requested to consider the aggregate length of all DPRs for evaluation.

In this regard, the Committee vide earlier Technical Minutes dated 10.03.2021 has already mentioned that, *"In case of In hand DPRs for NHAI Projects, Bidders furnished LOAs and Agreement copies without mentioning length of Projects due to which the committee assigned marks based on longest project with supporting documents. Further, total length of the Projects in a Package has been considered as one unit while arriving at length of Project as per RFP."* The same has clearly been mentioned in RFP as well. Hence, the request of Bidder cannot be considered thus summarily rejected.

- (ii) Further, regarding ***"Experience as Independent Engineer/Supervision Consultant in O&M Projects under DBFOT/OMT/O&M for 4/6 laning**of 50% of Project Length in last seven years"*** criteria, the bidder has requested to consider the projects in Sl. No.1 to 6 in their representation, duly citing that these Projects have the requisite Project Experience and accordingly requested to revise score from 7.5 to 8.

In this regard, upon examining the details furnished by the Bidder, the following are brought out;

- a. **Sl. No: 1:** Has less than 50% of Project Length (< 66.16 Km), hence, not considered.
 - b. **Sl. No. 2 to 5:** These Four Projects have already been considered and included in the initial evaluation itself. As such, no change.
 - c. **Sl. No. 6:** Experience of this Project cannot be considered as per RFP Section 3 Para ix-(d).
- (vii) Considering the above, the Committee has listed the Final Scores (no change in initial score) of the firm M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd., JV with Bloom Companies LLC in Association with M/s JR Consultancy Services Pvt. Ltd., Delhi is as under:

S. No	Description	Max Marks	Self-Evaluation	Initial Evaluation By NHAI	Final Evaluation by NHAI
1	Relevant experience for the assignment	35	35	29.5	29.5
2	Quality of approach and methodology	5	5	5	5
3	Experience in use of Technology for road inspection	20	19.5	19.0	19.0
4	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	40	37	34.32	34.32
Total		100	96.5	87.82	87.82

IV. **M/s MSV International Inc in association with MSV International Tech Pvt. Ltd., Gurugaoon** vide letter no. MSV/BD/2021/C-32282 dated 22.03.2021 has raised few objections towards the initial evaluation w.r.t proposed Key Personnel. Accordingly, the Tender Evaluation Committee has carefully reviewed each objection and the details of final evaluation scores along with justification are as under:

- (i) **Team Leader cum Highway Engineer:** The bidder has requested to review the section of "experience as Team Leader/Project Manager are in similar capacity" in O&M of completed 4/6 lane Highway section [40% Project Length or more of similar configuration (4/6 laning **) and above] for the Projects @ Sl.No. 2 and accordingly requested to revise the final score from 30.0 to 32.5.

As such, the Committee has examined the details provided by the bidder and has not considered the request of bidder, since, the listed Project do not have the requisite experience i.e. not in similar capacity and also has less than 40% of Project Length i.e. < 52.928 Km. As such, the initial score remains unchanged.

- (ii) Traffic and Transportation Expert: The bidder has requested to review the sections, Sl. No. 2 (ii) "experience in similar capacity as Traffic & Transportation Expert/Traffic Engineer/Transportation Expert on Major Highway Project (40% of Project length i.e. 52.928 Km length or more) of similar configuration 4/6 laning** and above" and Sl. No. 2 (iv) "experience in similar capacity in Road Safety aspects during various phases of Highway Projects". Accordingly, requested to consider and revise the score duly mentioning the Projects of Sl. No. 3,6,14,15,23,24,44,45 in Infracon.

Accordingly, the Committee has examined the Projects listed by the bidder and observed that, the Projects in Sl. No. 3,6,44,45 are not Major Highway Projects (i.e. Road Safety Study/Audit Projects only). Further, Projects in Sl. No. 15&23 has less than 40% of Project Length (< 52.928 Km). Also, Projects in Sl. No. 14 & 24 has already been considered in the initial evaluation itself. In view of the above observations, the Committee has not considered the representation of the bidder and hence there is no change in the initial scores.

- (iii) Road Safety Expert: The bidder has requested to review the experience in "Road Safety Management Plan for Inter-Urban Highways" as furnished by the bidder in Sl. No. 44,42,48,49 and accordingly requested to revise the initially assigned scores from 0 to 5.

As such, the Committee has examined the details provided by the bidder and has not considered the request of bidder since the listed Projects do not have the requisite experience. Also, Projects in Sl. No. 48 & 49 are not completed Projects, hence, the same cannot be considered for evaluation. As such the initial score remains unchanged.

- (iv) In this regard, Considering the above, the Committee has listed the Final Scores (no change in initial score) of the firm M/s MSV International Inc. in association with MSV International Tech Pvt. Ltd., Gurgaon is as under:

S.No	Description	Max Marks	Self-Evaluation	Initial Evaluation by NHAI	Final Evaluation by NHAI
1	Relevant experience for the assignment	35	35	32.5	32.5
2	Quality of approach and methodology	5	5	5	5
3	Experience in use of technology for road inspection	20	20	20	20
4	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	40	37.3	35.9	35.9
	Total	100	97.3	93.4	93.4



4. In view of the re-evaluation conducted by the Committee based on the request of the bidders, Final scores of the bidders are tabulated hereunder:

S. No	Name of the Bidder	Bid ID	Initial Scores Evaluated by NHAI	Final Scores Evaluated by NHAI
1	M/s Artefact Projects Ltd., Nagpur	223012	85.00	85.47
2	M/s. Feedback Infra Pvt. Ltd., Gurugram	223529	95.475	95.825
3	M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd., JV with Bloom Companies LLC in Association with M/s JR Consultancy Services Pvt. Ltd., Delhi.	223626	87.82	87.82
4	M/s MSV International Inc in association with MSV International Tech Pvt. Ltd., Gurugaon.	223686	93.40	93.40

5. Further, the Committee hereby recommends all four bidders as "Responsive Bids", based on the final scores of the Detailed Technical Evaluation and as per Para 8 of Instruction to Consultants in RFP, for Financial Bid Opening. The details of Responsive Bids are as under:

S. No	Name of the Bidder	Bid ID	Final Scores Evaluated by NHAI	Remarks
1	M/s. Feedback Infra Pvt. Ltd., Gurugram	223529	95.825	Qualified
2	M/s MSV International Inc in association with MSV International Tech Pvt. Ltd., Gurugaon.	223686	93.40	Qualified
3	M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd., JV with Bloom Companies LLC in Association with M/s JR Consultancy Services Pvt. Ltd., Delhi.	223626	87.82	Qualified
4	M/s Artefact Projects Ltd., Nagpur	223012	85.47	Qualified

In view of the above, the Committee further decided to meet at a convenient date & time for opening of Financial Bids of the qualified bidders upon receiving concurrence of the Competent Authority.


07/04/2021
(B Somasundaram)
Member


(G Athipathi)
Member


(MS Chaithanya)
Member


07/04/2021
(Govindasamy K)
Convenor

Signature Not Verified

Digitally signed by Govindasamy
Date: 2021.04.13 19:16:02 IST
Location: eProcurement System for
Central PSUs