

Minutes of Meeting of Tender Evaluation Committee held @ 11.00 Hrs on 01.04.2021, for the services of

"Independent Engineer Services" during Operation & Maintenance period for 2/4 laning of Trichy to Karur section of NH-67 from Km 135/800 to Km 218/028 (including Lalapet ROB 2.28 Km) in the State of Tamil Nadu under NHDP Phase-III on BOT (Toll) basis in the State of Tamil Nadu".

The Tender Evaluation Committee, constituted upon approval of the Regional Officer, Madurai has opened the bids @ 16:00 Hrs on 11.12.2020 and found that all the 6 Nos. of bids are responsive based on pre-technical scrutiny. Later, the Detailed Technical Evaluation of Bids was taken up on 24.02.2021. The Initial scores assigned to the bidders are tabulated as under:

S. No	Name of the Bidder	Bid ID	Initial Scores Evaluated by NHAI
1	M/s. Artefact Projects Ltd., Nagpur	218048	91.56
2	M/s. Feedback Infra Pvt. Ltd., Gurugram	218864	95.825
3	M/s. Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd., JV with Bloom Companies LLC in Association with M/s JR Consultancy Services Pvt. Ltd., Delhi.	218953	91.17
4	M/s. MSV International Inc in association with MSV International Tech Pvt. Ltd., Gurugram.	220860	95.99
5	M/s. Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd., Jaipur.	223408	97.255
6	M/s. L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd., Bhopal	223721	96.485

2. The evaluation sheets with the initial scores were circulated in Public Domain to receive objections from the bidders, if any, within a period of 07 days as per Para 5.3 (ii) of RFP. As the approved Minutes of Meeting along with annexure of Detailed Technical Evaluation sheets were uploaded in NHAI Public portal (www.nhai.org) on 08.03.2021, 07 days of time was considered until 15.03.2021. Accordingly, 2 numbers of bidders have furnished their objections/remarks towards the scores given against their technical bids.
3. Now, the Tender Evaluating Committee has examined the objections raised by the bidders and accordingly, the scores assigned were reviewed and following are brought out;
 1. M/s Feedback Infra Pvt. Ltd., Gurugram vide Letter No. FIPL/D/GEN/03-21/2202 dated 11.03.2021 has raised certain objections towards the initial evaluation done by NHAI w.r.t Key Personnel. The details are as under:



- (i) Regarding Team Leader cum Highway Engineer, the Bidder has represented to consider the experience of the Key Personnel and claimed 5 Marks duly citing the experience in similar capacity of Highway Development Projects taken up under PPP of 3 Projects (Project No.10, 11 & 14 in Infracon portal), however, in the initial evaluation, no projects were considered by NHAI.
- (ii) As per the request of bidder, the Committee has again reviewed the experience details and observed that, the above mentioned Projects are O&M Projects. As per RFP, Experience in similar capacity in Highway Development Projects under PPP only is taken up for consideration; hence the aforementioned Projects do not fall in such criteria. Accordingly, the request of the bidder is duly disallowed by the Committee. Thus, the initial score remains unchanged.
- (iii) Highway Maintenance cum Resident Engineer: The bidder has requested to consider the Experience in similar capacity in Project involving Construction/Maintenance works of 4/6 laning/Expressways (40% of project length i.e. 32.90 Km or more of similar configuration (4/6 laning**) and above), therein the bidder has requested for 25 marks against 22.5 marks valued by the Committee.
- (iv) Upon examining the representation of the bidder, the Committee has observed that, Project length @ S.No.6 in Infracon Portal is 24.24 Km (i.e. *after duly applying multiplication factor for 46.6 Km of 2-Lane & 5.6 Km of 4-Lane*) which is less than 40% of Project Length i.e. 32.90 Km. Hence, the same was not considered. Further, it is to mention that, the Projects listed in Sl.No. 3 & 4 were already considered & included in the initial evaluation itself. As such, no change is necessitated.
- (v) Senior Pavement Specialist: For this key personnel, the bidder has requested to consider the Experience in similar capacity on Major Highway Projects of similar configuration of 4/6 laning and above in innovative/non-traditional technology and design. In this regard, the firm has stated that, Project @ Sl. No. 101 & 103 to be considered under this criteria.
- (vi) However, upon examining the above mentioned Project Details in Infracon Portal, the Committee has observed that, the proposed Key Personnel has no such experience w.r.t innovative/non-traditional technology while execution of the said Projects. Also, experience certificate/document were also not uploaded in Infracon portal for claiming such experience. Hence, the Committee has duly disallowed the request of bidder and no change is necessitated.



(vii) Traffic & Transportation Expert/Traffic Engineer/Transportation Expert:

The bidder has represented regarding (ii) *experience in similar capacity as Traffic & Transportation Expert/Traffic Engineer/Transportation Expert on Major Highway Project (40% of Project length i.e. 32.90 Km length or more) of similar configuration 4/6 laning** and above & (iv) Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety aspects during various phases of Highway Project.*

(viii) Upon examining this representation, it is to mention that, the Committee has already evaluated the experience of the Key Personnel furnished in Infracon Portal duly following the provisions of RFP and accordingly the scores were assigned. Also, the bidder has not given any Project specific details/justification towards the additional marks, hence, the Committee has not considered the request of bidder and accordingly, there is no change is required in the scores assigned in initial evaluation.

(ix) In view of the above, the final scores of M/s Feedback Infra Pvt. Ltd., Gurugram is listed (no changes in the initial scores) as under:

S. No	Description	Max Marks	Self Evaluation	Initial Evaluation By NHAI	Final Evaluation by NHAI
1	Relevant experience for the assignment	35	35	34.5	34.5
2	Quality of approach and methodology	5	5	5	5
3	Experience in use of Technology for road inspection	20	20	20	20
4	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	40	37.6	36.325	36.325
Total		100	97.6	95.825	95.825

II. M/s. MSV International Inc in association with MSV International Tech Pvt. Ltd., Gurugram vide letter no. MSV/BD/2021/C-32230 dated 15.03.2021 has raised few objections towards the initial evaluation done by NHAI w.r.t proposed Key Personnel. Accordingly, the Tender Evaluation Committee has carefully reviewed each objection and the details of final evaluation scores along with justification are as under:

- (i) Road Safety Expert: The bidder has requested to review the section of "experience in similar capacity in preparation of Road safety Management Plan for Inter-Urban Highways" for the Projects @ Sl.No. 44, 42, 48 & 49.
- (ii) As such, the Committee has examined the details provided by the bidder and has not considered the request of bidder, since, the listed Projects do not have the requisite experience. Also, Projects in Sl. No. 48 & 49 are not



Completed Projects, hence, the same cannot be considered for evaluation. As such, the initial score remains unchanged.

- (iii) Traffic and Transportation Expert: The bidder has requested to review the total experience as 13 years. However, upon examining the same, the total Professional experience in Highway Projects is arrived to 12 years only i.e. from Sl. No. 16 to 52. Hence, no change is required in the initial score. Also, Projects listed in Sl. No. 53 & 54 cannot be considered as these are ongoing Projects. Hence, there shall be no additional marks to be given for the proposed key personnel. As such, the score remains unchanged.
- (iv) Further, the bidder has requested for additional marks for Traffic and Transportation Expert under criteria in S.No. 2 (ii) by mentioning that, the Projects listed in Sl. No. 16, 18, 23, 25, 26, 28, 29, 31, 32, 36, 53, 54 & 42 have 4-Lane configuration.
- (v) Accordingly, the Committee has examined the Projects listed by the bidder and observed that, the Sl. No. 16, 18, 25, 26, 28, 29, 31 & 32 are Feasibility Study/DPR Projects. Further, Sl. No. 53 & 54 are ongoing Projects and also the experience of the Key Personnel proposed in these Projects are Road Safety Audit/Black Spot related (Not Major Highway Project experience). Moreso, Sl.No. 36 was already considered during the initial evaluation and Sl.No. 42 is a duplication of Sl. No. 41 which was also already considered in the initial evaluation.
- (vi) In view of the above observations, the Committee has not considered the representation of the bidder and hence there is no change in the initial scores.
- (vii) Considering the above, the Committee has listed the Final Scores (no change in initial score) of the firm M/s MSV International Inc. in association with MSV International Tech Pvt. Ltd., Gurgaon is as under:

S.No	Description	Max Marks	Self-Evaluation	Initial Evaluation by NHAI	Final Evaluation by NHAI
1	Relevant experience for the assignment	35	35	35	35
2	Quality of approach and methodology	5	5	5	5
3	Experience in use of technology for road inspection	20	20	20	20
4	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	40	37.3	35.99	35.99
	Total	100	97.3	95.99	95.99

   

III. M/s Artefact Projects Ltd., Nagpur did not raise any Objections, hence, there is no change in the Final scores:

S. No	Description	Max Marks	Self Evaluation	Initial Evaluation By NHAI	Final Evaluation by NHAI
1	Relevant experience for the assignment	35	34.50	29	29
2	Quality of approach and methodology	5	5	5	5
3	Experience in use of Technology for road inspection	20	20	20	20
4	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	40	37.61	37.56	37.56
Total		100	97.11	91.56	91.56

IV. M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd., JV with Bloom Companies LLC in Association with M/s JR Consultancy Services Pvt. Ltd., Delhi did not raise any Objections hence there is no change in the Final scores:

S. No	Description	Max Marks	Self-Evaluation	Initial Evaluation By NHAI	Final Evaluation by NHAI
1	Relevant experience for the assignment	35	35	32	32
2	Quality of approach and methodology	5	5	5	5
3	Experience in use of Technology for road inspection	20	20	19	19
4	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	40	37.05	35.17	35.17
Total		100	97.05	91.17	91.17

V. M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd., Jaipur did not raise any Objections hence there is no change in the Final scores:

S. No	Description	Max Marks	Self-Evaluation	Initial Evaluation By NHAI	Final Evaluation by NHAI
1	Relevant experience for the assignment	35	35	34.75	34.75
2	Quality of approach and methodology	5	5	5	5
3	Experience in use of Technology for road inspection	20	20	20	20
4	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	40	37.915	37.505	37.505
Total		100	97.915	97.255	97.255

VI. M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd., Bhopal did not raise any Objections hence there is no change in the Final scores:

S. No	Description	Max Marks	Self Evaluation	Initial Evaluation By NHAI	Final Evaluation by NHAI
1	Relevant experience for the assignment	35	35	35	35
2	Quality of approach and methodology	5	5	4	4
3	Experience in use of Technology for road inspection	20	20	20	20
4	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	40	37.95	37.485	37.485
Total		100	97.95	96.485	96.485

5. In view of the re-evaluation conducted by the Committee based on the request of two bidders, Final scores of the bidders are tabulated hereunder:

S. No	Name of the Bidder	Bid ID	Initial Scores Evaluated by NHAI	Final Scores Evaluated by NHAI
1	M/s. Artefact Projects Ltd., Nagpur	218048	91.56	91.56
2	M/s. Feedback Infra Pvt. Ltd., Gurugram	218864	95.825	95.825
3	M/s. Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd., JV with Bloom Companies LLC in Association with M/s JR Consultancy Services Pvt. Ltd., Delhi.	218953	91.17	91.17
4	M/s. MSV International Inc in association with MSV International Tech Pvt. Ltd., Gurugram.	220860	95.99	95.99
5	M/s. Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd., Jaipur.	223408	97.255	97.255
6	M/s. L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd., Bhopal	223721	96.485	96.485

6. Accordingly, based on the Final Evaluation and as per para-8 of Information to Consultants, the following one bid is considered as "Non-Responsive bids" by the Technical Evaluating Committee since this bidder has not secured the position in the top five bids;

Name of the Bidder	Bid ID	Final Scores Evaluated by NHAI	Remarks
M/s. Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd., JV with Bloom Companies LLC in Association with M/s JR Consultancy Services Pvt. Ltd., Delhi.	218953	91.17	Not Qualified As per Para 8 of Information to Consultants.

7. Further, the Committee hereby recommends the Top Five Qualified Bids as "Responsive Bids", based on the final scores of the Detailed Technical Evaluation and as per Para 8 of Instruction to Consultants in RFP, for Financial Bid Opening. The details of **Responsive Bids** are as under:

S. No	Name of the Bidder	Bid ID	Final Scores Evaluated by NHAI	Remarks
1	M/s. Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd., Jaipur.	223408	97.255	Qualified
2	M/s. L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd., Bhopal	223721	96.485	Qualified
3	M/s. MSV International Inc in association with MSV International Tech Pvt. Ltd., Gurugao.	220860	95.99	Qualified
4	M/s. Feedback Infra Pvt. Ltd., Gurugram	218864	95.825	Qualified
5	M/s. Artefact Projects Ltd., Nagpur	218048	91.56	Qualified

In view of the above, the Committee further decided to meet at a convenient date & time for opening of Financial Bids of the qualified bidders upon receiving concurrence of the Competent Authority.


01/04/21
(B Somasundaram)
Member


01/04/21
(G Athipathi)
Member


(MS Chaithanya)
Member


01/04/2021
(Govindasamy K)
Convenor