



भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण
(सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय)
National Highways Authority of India

(Ministry of Road Transport and Highways)

जी-5 एवं 6, सेक्टर-10, द्वारका, नई दिल्ली-110075

G-5 & 6, Sector-10, Dwarka, New Delhi-110075

NHAI/Raj/11012/Deoli-Kota/rehabilitation/ SC /E-33873/19186

दूरभाष / Phone : 91-11-25074100/25074200

फैक्स / Fax : 91-11-25093507 / 25093514

Dated: 14.01.2021

To,

All Applicant Bidders,

Sub: Supervision Consultancy Services for construction supervision of the Rehabilitation and Reconstruction work and other incidental works of Deoli-Kota section (Design Km.167.624 to Km. 250.144) Section of NH- 12 (New NH- 52) in the state of Rajasthan-(Tender ID: **2020_NHAI_58655_1**):- - Technical evaluation of Bids- Reg.

Ref: Bid submitted on 11.11.2020 for the above mentioned work.

This is with reference to the bids submitted on 11.11.2020 for the subject proposal. The Result of technical evaluation is as under:-

S.No.	Name of the Applicant	Marks	Status	Remarks
1.	LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in association with Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Lt	94.305	Qualified	-
2.	MSV International Inc. in association with ARMENGE Engineering and Management Consultants Pvt Ltd	89.840	Qualified	-
3.	URS Scott Wilson India Private Limited in association with STRIDER CONSULTING ENGINEERS PRIVATE LIMITED	88.475	Qualified	-
4.	L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd. in association with Intratech civil Solution & Consultant	80.390	Qualified	-
5.	Theme Engineering Services Private Limited	0	Not Qualified	Debarred for 2 years from bidding process as per letter NHAI/JH/SC/RRJ/NH-33/2019/106 dated 17.12.2020

Detailed Evaluation sheet are attached in Annexure-I.

2. As per clause 5.3 of Section-2 (ITB) of RFP Bidders are given opportunity to respond by 20.01.2021 up to 1700 Hrs.in case if they have any objection.

Encl: As above

(Sanjeev Sharma)
General Manager (Tech)-Raj.

FINAL RESULT (SUMMARY OF TECHNICAL EVALUATION)

Supervision Consultancy Services For Construction Supervision of the Rehabilitation and Reconstruction works and other incidental works of Deoli-Kota Section (Design Km. 167.624 to Km. 250.144) section of NH-12(New NH-52) in the state of Rajasthan.

S. No.	Details	Max. Marks	1			
			LN	LASA	MSV	URS
			MALVIYA			
1	Firm Experience	20	8.000	20.000	16.000	17.500
2	Work Plan & Methodology	5	5.000	5.000	5.000	5.000
3	Team Leader	25	22.168	23.875	22.500	21.500
4	Resident Cum Highway Engineer-1	7.5	6.413	6.575	6.675	5.775
5	Resident Cum Highway Engineer-2	7.5	6.450	6.675	6.975	6.450
6	Bridge/Structural Engineer	12	10.440	10.920	11.400	10.880
7	Senior Quality cum Material Expert	12	10.920	10.920	11.280	10.920
8	Senior Contract Specialist	11	11.000	10.340	10.010	10.450
	Total	100	80.390	94.305	89.840	88.475

Key Personnel	Max. Points	LN MALVIYA		LASA		MSV		URS	
		As per evaluation Out of 100	As per evaluation out of Max. Points	As per evaluation Out of 100	As per evaluation out of Max. Points	As per evaluation Out of 100	AS PER Evaluation out of Maximum points	As per evaluation Out of 100	AS PER Evaluation out of Maximum points
TL	25	88.67	22.168	95.5	23.875	90	22.5	86	21.5
RE-1	7.5	85.5	6.413	87.67	6.575	89	6.675	77	5.775
RE-2	7.5	86	6.450	89	6.675	93	6.975	86	6.45
BSE	12	87	10.440	91	10.920	95	11.4	90.67	10.8804
SQME	12	91	10.920	91	10.920	94	11.28	91	10.92
SCS	11	100	11.000	94	10.340	91	10.01	95	10.45
Total	75		67.39		69.305		68.84		65.9754

Assessment of Experience of the Firm

S.No.	Description	Maximum Marks	LN MALVIYA	LASA	MSV	URS
1	Experience as Construction Supervision/Authority's Engineer in Highway Projects (4/6) lane* of length equal to 82.52 Km or more in last 7 years - (i) 1 Projects - 9 Marks Add 1 (one) marks for each additional project maximum upto 3 (three) marks	12	0	12	9	10
2	Experience as Independent consultant in Highway Projects (4/6) lane* of length equal to 82.52 Km or more on PPP mode in last 7 years - (i) 1 Projects - 3 Marks Add 0.5(half) marks for each additional project maximum upto 1 (one) marks	4	4	4	3	3.5
3	Experience in DPR preparation in Highway Projects (4/6) lane* of length equal to 82.52 km or more in last 7 years Projects - 3 Marks Add 0.5(half) marks for each additional project maximum upto 1 (one) marks	4	4	4	4	4
Total		20	8	20	16	17.5
Total Score claimed by Consultant			20	20	20	20

Adequacy of the Proposed Work and Methodology

S.No.	Description	Maximum Marks	LN MALVIYA		LASA		MSV		URS	
			Marks		Marks		Marks		Marks	
a	Comments/Suggestion on TOR	1	1		1		1		1	
b	Quality of Approach and Methodology	3	3		3		3		3	
(i)	Methodology	1	1		1		1		1	
(ii)	Contract Management Approach	1	1		1		1		1	
(iii)	Quality Control and Quality Assurance	1	1		1		1		1	
c	Quality Audit Methodology and Quality Assurance Plan	1	1		1		1		1	
	Total	5	5		5		5		5	

Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer						
S. No.	Description	LN MALVIYA(Ja ynandan Kumar)	LASA- (Sh.Syamal Chaudhuri)	MSV (Syed mahaboobhasha)	URS (Ram Mohan Rao)	
		Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained	
1	General Qualification	25	21	25	21	
(i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	
(ii)	Post Graduation in Construction management/Bridge engineering/Highway/Traffic and Transportation Engineering	4	0	4	0	
2	Adequacy for the Project	70	74.5	65	65	
(a)	Professional Experience in Highway Projects:					
	Total Highway Professional Experience					
	< 15 years - 0 Marks					
(i)	15 years - 19 Marks	25	25	25	25	
	Add Two marks for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 6 (Six) Marks.					
	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in supervision/construction of Highway Project with flexible pavement/Bridge Projects					
(ii)	< 10 years (Points- 0)	20	20	20	20	
	10 years (Points -16)					
	Add 2 marks for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (Four) marks.					
	Experience in Highway Development Project of International Assignments in similar capacity having highway contracts of similar or large size					
(iii)	< 2 Years (Point-0)	5	5	0	0	
	2 years (Points - 4)					
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 1(one) marks					
(iv)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in highway development Project of 4/6* lane of length equa to 33.00 Km Comprosing of flexible pavement /rigid pavement ocnstruction.					
	< 2 projects -0	10	10	10	10	
	2 projects -8					
	Add 1 marks for each additional completed project subject to maximum 2 marks.					
(v)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in highway development Project of 4/6* lane of length equa to 33.00 Km on FIDIC format Comprosing of flexible pavement /rigid pavement ocnstruction.					
	1 projects -8 marks	10	10	10	10	
	Add 1 marks extra for each additional completed project subject to maximum 2 (two) marks					
3	Employment with the Firm					
	<1 year -0	5	0	0	0	
	1 year -3					
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks					
	Total Score Achieved	100	88.67	90	86	
	Total Score Claimed by Consultant		91	95	91	

Resident Cum Highway Engineer-1						
S. No.	Description	LN MALVIYA (B.P.Singh)	LASA- (Sh.Nagendra Singh)	MSV (Ajit Ashok Kumar)	URS (Manish Vijay)	
		Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained	Marks obtained	
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	
i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	
ii)	Post Graduation in Construction Mngement / Highway Engineering	4	0	0	0	
2	Adequacy for the Project	70	64.5	68	56	
i)	Total Professional Experience					
	<10 years -0	20	20	20	20	
	10 years -16					
	Add two marks extra for eeh additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.					
ii)	Experience as Resident Engineer/Assisatnt-Resident Engineer/ Highway Engineer / Project Director/Project Manager/Superintending Engineer /Executive Engineer on works of Major Highway Projects of 4/6 lane* of length equal to 33.00 Km or more.					
	<8 years -0	15	15	15	15	
	8 years -10					
	Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks					
iii)	Experience as Resident Engineer/Assisatnt-Resident Engineer/Highway Engineer/Project Director/Project Manager/ Superintending Engineer/Executive Engineer on Works of Major Highway Projects of 4/6 lane* of length equal to 33.00 Km or more.					
	<2 Projects -0	15	15	15	15	
	2 Projects -10					
	Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional completed project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks.					
iv)	Experience of handling World Bank/ADB/NHAI funded highway projects on similar capacity as mentioned in Sr. Nop.(ii)above					
	1 Project - 6 Marks	10	9	10	6	
	Add 1 (one) marks for each additional completed projrect subject to maximum 4 (four) marks					
v)	Experience of hanadling FIDIC Construct in somilar capacity as mentioned in sr. no.(ii) above					
	< 2 years - 0 Marks	10	8	8	0	
	2 years & more with internation experience - 10 Marks without international experience - 8 Marks					
3	Employment with the Firm					
	< 1 year -0	5	0	0	0	
	1 year -3					
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks					
	Total Score Achieved	100	85.5	89	77	
	Total Score Claimed by Consultant	91	89	93	95	

Resident Cum Highway Engineer-II						
S. No.	Description		LN MALVIYA(Mu rari Kumar Singh)	LASA(Ashok Kumar Singh)	MSV (M. Balaraju)	URS (Pankaj Kumar Mangalam)
			Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained	
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21
i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21
ii)	Post Graduation in Construction Mngement / Highway Engineering	4	0	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70	65	68	68	65
	Total Professional Experience					
i)	Total Professional Experience					
	<10 years -0					
	10 years -16					
	Add two marks extra for ech additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.	20	20	20	20	20
ii)	Experience as Resident Engineer/Assisntant-Resident Engineer/ Highway Engineer / Project Director/Project Manager/Superintending Engineer /Executive Engineer on works of Major Highway Projects of 4/6 lane* of length equal to 33.00 Km or more.	15	15	15	15	15
	<8 years -0					
	8 years -10					
	Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks					
iii)	Experience as Resident Engineer/Assisatnt-Resident Engineer/Highway Engineer/Project Director/Projectr Manager/ Superintending Engineer/Executive Engineer on Works of Major Highway Projects of 4/6 lane* of length equal to 33.00 Km or more.	15	15	15	15	15
	<2 Projects -0					
	2 Projects -10					
	Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks.					
iv)	Experience of handling World Bank/ADB/NHAI funded highway projects om similar capacity as mentioned in Sr. Nop.(ii)above	10	7	10	10	7
	1 Project - 6 Marks					
	Add 1 (one) marks for each additional complated project subject to maximum 4 (four) marks					
(v)	Experience of hanadling FIDIC Construct in somilar capacity as mentioned in sr. no.(ii) above	10	8	8	8	8
	<2 years - 0 Marks					
	2 years & more with internation experience - 10 Marks without international experience - 8 Marks					
3	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	4	0
	< 1 year -0					
	1 year -3					
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks					
	Total Score Achieved	100	86	89	93	86
	Total Score Claimed by Consultant		91	89	97	91

Bridge/Structural Engineer						
S. No.	Description		LN MALVIVA(Mallesh)	LASA- (Swaraj Kumar Bordoloi)	MSV (RAMUDU BELLALA)	URS (Dokka Lakshmi Narayana)
			Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained	
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21
i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21
ii)	Post Graduation in Structural Engineering	4	0	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70	66	70	70	69.67
i)	Total Professional Experience					
	<15 years -0					
	15 years -16	20	20	20	20	20
	Add two marks extra for each additional year subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.					
ii)	Experience in Bridge construction works on Highways (supervision/Construction)					
	<10 years -0	20	16	20	20	20
	10 years -15					
	Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks.					
iii)	Experience in construction of deep foundation viz. well/pile foundations as Bridge/structural Engineer	15	15	15	15	14.67
	<3 projects -0					
	3 Projects -12 Marks					
	Add 1 (One) mark extra for each additional projects of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.					
(iv)	Experience in construction of Major Bridge of length more than 200m as Bridge/Structural engineer	15	15	15	15	15
	< 2 Major Bridge -0 Marks					
	2 Major Bridge - 12 Marks					
	Add 1.5 Marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 3 (Three) marks					
3	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	4	0
	<1 year -0					
	1 year -3					
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks					
	Total Score Achieved	100	87	91	95	90.67
	Total Score Claimed by Consultant		91	91	95	91

Senior Quality Cum Material Expert						
	Description		LN MALVIYA (Piyush Rai)	LASA (Tejendra Chaturvedi)	MSV (Chaturbhuj Sharma)	URS (Binay Kumar)
			Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21
i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21
ii)	Post Graduation in Geotechnical Engineering/Highway engineering in addition in above	4	0	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70	70	70	70	70
	Professional Experience					
i)	Total Experience in Quality/Material aspects if Highways					
	< 10 years -0					
	10 years -22	30	30	30	30	30
	Add two mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks					
ii)	Experience of similar nature in Construction/ Supervision works of highway project s of 4/6 lane* of length equal to 33.00 km or more as Material/Geo-Technical Engineer					
	< 5 years -0	20	20	20	20	20
	5 years -15					
	Add 1.0 (one) marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks					
iii)	Experience in handling Similar Highway projects of 4/6 lane* of length equal to 33.00 Km. or more / Bridge Project costing not less than Rs. 100 Crores of as Material Engineer/Geo-Technical					
	< 2 nos -0	15	15	15	15	15
	2 nos -10					
	Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks					
	Work experience in Highways Projects as Material Engineer					
iv)	< 1 year -0	5	5	5	5	5
	1 Year -03					
	add 1 marks for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 2 (two) marks					
3	Employment with the Firm					
	< 1 year -0	5	0	0	3	0
	1 year -3					
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks					
	Total Score Achieved	100	91	91	94	91
	Total score claimed by consultant		91	91	94	91

Senior Contract Specialist						
S. No.	Description		LN MALVIYA (Vivek Verma)	LASA (Ajay Kumar Singh)	MSV (Sanjeev Kumar Bhatnagar)	URS (Subhash Chand Jindal)
			Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained	Marks Obtained
1	General Qualification					
i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	25	25	21	21	25
ii)	Degree in Law/PG management/certificate course in management/certificate course in construction management/certificate course in contract management.	21	21	21	21	21
		4	4	0	0	4
2	Adequacy for the Project					
	Professional Experience	70	70	70	70	70
i)	Total Professional in contract management					
	<15 years -0	20	20	20	20	20
	15 years -15					
	Add one marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks.					
ii)	Experience as contract specialist on any National/State Highway Projects (2 lane and above configuration of highways)					
	<4 years -0	20	20	20	20	20
	4 years -15					
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks					
iii)	Experience in contract management of a large highways contract say over Rs.150 crore including experience of handling Variation orders, claims of contractor and their appropriate disposal (2-lane and above configurations highways)					
	<1 nos -0	25	25	25	25	25
	2 nos -16					
	Add two marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 marks					
iv)	Experience in handled Arbitration cases in respect of any Highways project of 4/6 lane of length equal to 33.00 km.					
	Experience in 1 Project - 3	5	5	5	5	5
	More than one project- 5 marks					
3	Employment with the Firm					
	< 1 year -0	5	5	3	0	0
	1 year -3					
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks					
	Total Score Achieved	100	100	94	91	95
	Total Score Claimed by Consultant		100	98	91	100

Signature Not Verified

Digitally signed by SANJEEV SHARMA
Date: 2021.01.14 10:50:15 IST
Location: eProcurement System for
Central PSUs