



भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण

(सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय)

National Highways Authority of India

(Ministry of Road Transport and Highways)

जी-5 एवं 6, सेक्टर-10, द्वारका, नई दिल्ली-110075

G-5 & 6, Sector-10, Dwarka, New Delhi-110075

दूरभाष / Phone : 91-11-25074100/25074200

फैक्स / Fax : 91-11-25093507 / 25093514

NHAI/Tech/BH/IE/RB/2021/ E-183938

Date: 26.03.2021

To

All applicant bidders

Subject:- Independent Engineer Services for supervision of, (i) four laning of Rajauli-Bakhtiyarpur section of NH-31(New NH-20) from Km 54+405 to Km101+630 (Package II) (ii) four laning of Rajauli-Bakhtiyarpur section of NH-31(New NH-20) from Km 101+630 to Km 152+520 (Package-III), on Hybrid Annuity Mode in the State of Bihar- **Technical Evaluation of Bids- Reg.**

Ref: Bids submitted on 18.11.2020 for the above mentioned work.

This is with reference to the bids submitted on 18.11.2020 for the subject proposal. The result of Technical Evaluation is as under.

- (i) **First Stage Technical Evaluation** (Experience of the applicants in completed projects in last seven year, minimum eligibility requirement as per RFP & **Technical capacity of bidder**):-Out of 10 applicant bidders, 4 Bidders satisfy the minimum eligibility criteria as per RFP for first stage.

S.No.	Name of the bidder	Remarks (Reason of Non- Responsiveness)
1.	M/s. Highway Engineering Consultant*	Non- Responsive (Annual Turnover and Technical Capacity)
2.	M/s. LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd.	Responsive
3.	M/s MSV International Inc. in Associates with M/s Designilla.	Responsive
4.	M/s TPF Getisa Euroestudios S.L. in Associates with M/s TPF Engineering Pvt. Ltd**	Non- Responsive (Technical Capacity)
5.	M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Private Limited in Associates with M/s Quest Engineers And Consultants Private Limited***	Non- Responsive (Technical Capacity)
6.	M/s Intercontinental Consultants and Technocrats Pvt. Ltd. in Associates with M/s MSPARK Futuristics & Associates****	Non- Responsive (Technical Capacity)
7.	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in JV with M/s Satra Services and Solutions Private Limited.	Responsive
8.	M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s CMEC Consulting Engineers Pvt. Ltd. in Associates with M/s Upham International Corporation Private Limited.#	Non- Responsive (Annual Turnover)

4

9.	M/s Centro De Estudios De Materiales Y Control De Obra S.A. (CEMOSA) in JV with M/s YONGMA Engineering CO LTD in Associates with M/s Vaishnavi Infratech Services Private Limited *****	Non- Responsive (Technical capacity & Submission of false POA of JV partner)
10.	M/s. Chaitanya Projects Private Limited in JV with ISAN Corporation	Responsive

*As per Section-1(C) the bidder falls under the category 2 on the basis annual turnover and minimum no. key professionals, accordingly the maximum number of projects to be allotted to the Consultant including ongoing projects at a time are sixteen (16). The bidder is already having 3 DPR & 19.70 IE/AE Projects in hand, hence, the bidder is not eligible to undertake additional projects over and above 16 as per Section-1(C). Also the annual average turnover of firm for previous 5 FY is 39.23 Cr. which less than 2% of BPC 67.5 Cr. As per requirement of RFP clause 15 A 1(a). Accordingly, **M/s Highway Engineering Consultant considered to be Non-responsive.**

As per Section-1(C) the bidder falls under the category 1 on the basis annual turnover and minimum no. key professionals, as accordingly the maximum number of projects to be allotted to the Consultant including ongoing projects at a time are Eight (8). The bidder is already having 2 DPR and 12.67 IE/AE Projects in hand, hence, the bidder is not eligible to undertake additional projects over and above 8 as per Section-1(C). Accordingly, **M/s TPF Getisa Euroestudios S.L. in Associates with M/s TPF Engineering Pvt. Ltd. considered to be Non-responsive.

***As per Section-1(C) the bidder falls under the category 3 on the basis annual turnover and minimum no. key professionals, accordingly the maximum number of projects to be allotted to the Consultant including ongoing projects at a time are thirty (30). The bidder is already having 3 DPR and 32 IE/AE Projects in hand, hence, the bidder is not eligible to undertake additional projects over and above 30 as per Section-1(C). Accordingly, **M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Private Limited in Associates with M/s Quest Engineers And Consultants Private Limited considered to be Non-responsive.**

**** Further, As per requirement of RFP Section- 1(C)-(viii), the Consulting Firms shall submit at least 10 Form-26AS in order to certify their permanent key personnel along with the proposed candidates. In this regard the Form 26AS for financial year 2019-2020 and onwards has been considered. But in case of **M/s INTERCONTINENTAL CONSULTANTS AND TECHNOCRATS PVT. LTD. in Associates with M/s MSPARK FUTURISTICS & ASSOCIATES**, the same is not provided. Hence, considered to be Non-responsive.

***** Further, As per requirement of RFP Section- 1(C)-(viii), the Consulting Firms shall submit at least 10 Form-26AS in order to certify their permanent key personnel along with the proposed candidates. In this regard the Form 26AS for financial year 2019-2020 and onwards has been considered. But in case of **M/s Centro De Estudios De Materiales Y Control De Obra S.A. (CEMOSA) in JV with M/s YONGMA Engineering CO LTD in Associates with M/s Vaishnavi Infratech Services Private Limited**, the same is not provided, also document of POA submitted by JV partner is signed on 31.03.2020 in the stamp of 19.05.2020. Hence, considered to be Non-responsive.

As per requirement of RFP clause 15 (B) the annual average turnover of firms in JV jointly should meet not less than 1.2 times for previous 5 FY i.e. Rs. 81 Cr but in case of **M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s CMEC Consulting Engineers Pvt. Ltd. in Associates with M/s Upham International Corporation Private Limited** the joint Turnover of company turned out as Rs.67.72 Cr. Accordingly, the Bidder considered as Non-Responsive.

A

(ii) **Second Stage Technical Evaluation** :- The detailed result is annexed as **Annexure -A**

Sr. No.	Name of Firm	Firm's relevant experience in last 7 years	Experience in use of technology for road inspection	Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment	Total	Rank
		40	20	40	100	
1/10	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd.	38.00	20.00	36.80	94.80	I
2/10	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in JV with M/s Satra Services and Solutions Private Limited.	38.00	20.00	35.96	93.96	II
3/10	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s ISAN Corporation	35.50	20.00	35.99	91.49	III
4/10	MSV International Inc Association with M/s Designilla **	36.00	20.00	33.45	89.45	IV
5/10	M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Private Limited in Associates with M/s Quest Engineers and Consultants Private Limited	Non-responsive(Technical capacity)				
6/10	M/s Intercontinental Consultants and Technocrats Pvt. Ltd. in Associates with M/s MSPARK Futuristics & Associates	Non-responsive(Technical capacity)				
7/10	M/s. Highway Engineering Consultant	Non-responsive(Turnover & Technical Capacity)				
8/10	M/s TPF Getisa Euroestudios S.L. in Associates with M/s TPF Engineering Pvt. Ltd*	Non-responsive(Technical capacity)				
9/10	M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s CMEC Consulting Engineers Pvt. Ltd. in Associates with M/s Upham International Corporation Private Limited.	Non-responsive (Turnover)				

4

10/10	M/s Centro De Estudios De Materiales Y Control De Obra S.A. (CEMOSA) in JV with M/s YONGMA Engineering CO LTD in Associates with M/s Vaishnavi Infratech Services Private Limited	Non- Responsive (Technical Capacity & Submission of false POA)
-------	---	---

**** As per RFP clause 13 (B) the maximum no. of Key personnel from Associate firm during RFP proposal should be limited to 2 no. but in case of **MSV International Inc Association with M/s Designilla** the team formed by the bidder at Infracon portal shows 3 no. of Key personnel from the side of Associate member. Accordingly, the marks of Resident cum Highway Engineer (i.e. **Mr. Jainendra Kumar**) which hold minimum marks according to RFP, considered as **Zero**.**

2. Bidders are given opportunity to respond by 05.04.2021 upto 1130 hrs IST, in case of any objection and submit the requisite details/ documents within this period.



(K K Arora)
GM (Tech.)
Bihar Division

Name of the Project											
0											
Annexure A											
Final Comparative Technical Evaluation Score.											
S. No.	Name of Bidder	Relevant Experience for the assignment*		Evaluation Criteria for assessment of experience in use of technology for road inspection		Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment*		Total		Rank of the Firm	whether the Technical Response Applicant/Bidder Eligible for opening of Financial proposal**
		Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed		
		Maximum marks	40	40	20	20	40	40	100		
1/10	M/s INTERCONTINENTAL CONSULTANTS AND TECHNOCRATS PVT. LTD in Associates with M/s MSPARK FUTURISTICS &	Non - Responsive									Non-Responsive
2/10	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Jv with M/s ISAN Corporation	40.00	35.50	20.00	20.00	36.88	35.99	96.88	91.49	3	Responsive
3/10	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd.	40.00	38.00	20.00	20.00	37.64	36.80	97.64	94.80	1	Responsive
4/10	M/s MSV International Inc in Associates with M/s Designilla	40.00	36.00	20.00	20.00	37.25	33.45	97.25	89.45	4	Responsive
5/10	M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. in Jv with M/s CMEC CONSULTING ENGINEERS PVT. LTD. in Associates with M/s UPHAM INTERNATIONAL CORPORATION PRIVATE LIMITED	Non - Responsive									Non-Responsive
6/10	M/s SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED in Associates with M/s QUEST ENGINEERS AND CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED	Non - Responsive									Non-Responsive
7/10	M/s Centro De Estudios De Materiales Y Control De Obra S.A. (CEMOSA) in Jv with M/s YONGMA ENGINEERING CO LTD in Associates with M/s Vaishnavi Inftratech Services Private Limited	Non - Responsive									Non-Responsive
8/10	M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L. in Associates with M/s TPF Engineering Pvt Ltd	Non - Responsive									Non-Responsive
9/10	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in JV with M/s SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS PRIVATE LIMITED	40.00	38.00	20.00	20.00	37.12	35.96	97.12	93.96	2	Responsive
10/10	M/s HIGHWAY ENGINEERING CONSULTANT	Non - Responsive									Non-Responsive

Technical Capacity Assessment A

S. No.	List of Applicant	Status	Avg. annual Turnover of Firm in Last 3 FY in Crores	No. of Key Professional on full time rolls	Category as per RFP	Max. no of project can be allotted as per RFP	In Hand				Eligibility for new projects		Eligible
							No. of Employees less than 10				DPR	AVH/CS	
1	M/s INTERCONTINENTAL CONSULTANTS AND TECHNOCRATS PVT. LTD in Associates with M/s MSPARK FUTURISTICS & ASSOCIATES	Associates	190.02	0	0	8	3.50	2.1	5.15	3.09	2.81	2.91	Non - Eligible
2	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s ISAN Corporation	JV Lead Other	42.85 498.75	33 0	19.8	1	0	0	0	0	24.94	15.14	Eligible
3	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd.	Sole	330.3	71	4	50	3	22.36	18.00	5	4.5	4.5	Eligible
4	M/s MSV International Inc in Associates with M/s Deshpande	Associates	57.76	50	3	30	7	18.00	18.00	5	4.5	4.5	Eligible
5	M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s CMEC CONSULTING ENGINEERS PVT. LTD. in Associates with M/s UPHAM INTERNATIONAL CORPORATION PRIVATE LIMITED	JV/Associates Lead Other	50.75 38.246	35 12	25.8	2	16	4.00 0	2.4	6.30 0.7	4.06	9.54	Eligible
6	M/s SA INFRASTRUCTURE CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED in Associates with M/s QUEST ENGINEERS AND CONSULTANTS PRIVATE LIMITED	Associates	55.01	50	3	30	3	32.00	0	0	0	0	Non - Eligible
7	M/s Centro De Estudios De Materiales Y Control De Obras S.A. (CEMOSA) in JV with M/s YONGMA ENGINEERING CO LTD in Associates with M/s Vashnavi Infotech Services Private Limited	JV/Associates Lead Other	118.67 94.33	6 12	8.4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	Non - Eligible
8	M/s TPE GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L. in Associates with M/s TPE Engineering Pvt Ltd	Associates	385.44	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	Non - Eligible
9	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in JV with M/s SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS PRIVATE LIMITED	JV Lead Other	283.7 44.09	39 38	38.5	2	16	6.60 1.00	3.8	9.25 2.60	5.9248	6.3	Eligible
10	M/s HIGHWAY ENGINEERING CONSULTANT	Sole	42.04	34	2	30	5	19.70	0	0	0	0	Non - Eligible

Firm Experience 0Annexure A

S.N o.	Applicant No.		2/10	3/10	4/10	9/10
	Description	Max Marks	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Jv with M/s ISAN Corporation	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd.	M/s MSV Internationa l Inc in Associates with M/s Designilla	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in JV with M/s SATRA
			Assesed	Assesed	Assesed	Assesed
			35.50	38.00	36.00	38.00
	Average Annual Turnover (last 5 years or in each of the preceding two years) from consultancy business	2	2	2	2	2
	< 2% of TPC - 0 marks	0			0	
1	2% of TPC - 1.5 marks	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5
	Add for additional turnover 0.25 (Zero point two five) marks for every 1% of TPC above 2% of TPC subject to maximum 0.5 marks.	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5
	Nos. of Highway Professionals with the firm *	10	10	10	10	10
2	<10 - 0 marks					
	10 to 20 - 8 marks					
	> 20 but <=30 - 9 marks					
	> 30 - 10 marks		10	10	10	10
	Experience as Independent Engineer/ Construction Supervision in Number of Highway Projects of 2/4/6-laning** of length (40% of project length) or more in last 7 years.	12	11	12	12	12
3	1 project - 9 marks	9	9	9	9	9
	Add 1(one) mark extra for completed assignment of Independent Engineer and add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for completed assignment of supervision consultancy subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.	3	2	3	3	3
	Experience in DPR/Feasibility Study cum Preliminary Design Report preparation for Number of Highway Projects of 2/4/6-laning** of length (40% of project length) or more in last 7 years.	6	5.5	6	5	6
4	1 project - 4 marks	4	4	4	4	4
	Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 marks.	2	1.5	2	1	2
	In hand DPRs of Highway/ Bridge/ Tunnel Projects (presently under progress)	6	4	4	4	4
5	< 2 projects - 0 marks					
	2-5 projects - 4 marks		4	4	4	4
	> 5 projects - 6 marks					
	Experience in Construction Supervision/ DPR/ Design Review of Major structures having length of more than 500 metre in last 7 years.	4	3	4	3	4
6	1 project - 2 marks	2	2	2	2	2
	Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 marks.	2	1	2	1	2
	Total	40.00	35.50	38.00	36.00	38.00
			2	3	4	9

Technology

1+405 to Km101+630 (Package II) (ii) four laning of Rajauli- Bakhtiya

Evaluation Criteria for assessment of experience in use of technology for road inspection

S.N	Applicant No.	Max Marks	2/10 M/s Chaltanya Projects Consultan cy Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/c Assesed	3/10 M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. Assesed	4/10 M/s MSV Internatio nal Inc In Associates with M/s Designilla Assesed	9/10 M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited In JV with M/c Assesed
1	Experience In Network Survey Vehicle (NSV) or better technology for pavement inspection	5	5	5	5	5
	Own an equipment on MOU with Associate or hiring basis	1				
	Own Equipment	2	2	2	2	2
	1-2 projects	1				
	3-5 projects	2				
2	>5 projects	3	3	3	3	3
	Experience In Falling Weight Deflectometer (FWD) or better technology for pavement strength measurement	4	4	4	4	4
	Own an equipment on MOU with Associate or hiring basis	1				
	Own Equipment	2	2	2	2	2
	1-3 projects	1				
3	> 3 projects	2	2	2	2	2
	Experience In Mobile Bridge Inspection Unit (MBIU) or better technology for bridges inspection	4	4	4	4	4
	Own an equipment on MOU with Associate or hiring basis	1				
	Own Equipment	2	2	2	2	2
	1-2 projects	1				
4	>3 projects	2	2	2	2	2
	Experience In Retro reflectometer technology	4	4	4	4	4
	Own an equipment on MOU with Associate or hiring basis	1				
	Own Equipment	2	2	2	2	2
	1-3 projects	1				
5	>3 projects	2	2	2	2	2
	Experience In Automatic Traffic Counter cum Classifier	3	3	3	3	3
	Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis	1				
	Own Equipment	2	2	2	2	2
	1-3 projects	0.5				
	>3 projects	1	1	1	1	1
	Total	20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00	20.00
			2	3	4	9

Answer A

Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer						
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	2/10	3/10	4/10	9/10
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s ISAN	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd.	M/s MSV International Inc in Associates with M/s Designilla	Feedback Infra Private Limited in JV with M/s SATRA SERVICES
	Name of Key Personnel		Mr. Shallesh	Mr.	Mr.	Mr. Umesh
	Date of Birth of KP's		1/9/1970	15/08/1958	17/03/1956	8/1/1963
	Description		Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	24
i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21
ii)	Post Graduation in Management/ Construction/ Transportation/Highway Engineering/ Structural Engineering or equivalent specialised stream of civil engineering	3	0	0	0	3
iii)	Degree/Diploma/Certificate in Project Management	1	0	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70				
a)	Professional Experience in Highway Projects:					
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway projects	10	10	10	10	10
i)	< 12 years -0					
	12 years -8		8	8	8	8
	Add 1 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 2 (three) marks.		2	2	2	2
ii)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Highway Development projects similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	15	15	15	15	15
	< 5 years - 0					
	5 years - 11		11	11	11	11
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	4	4	4
iii)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Highway Development projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) on PPP	5	5	4	5	4
	1 Project- 4 Marks		4	4	4	4
	add 1 mark extra for additional projects subject to maximum 1 (one) marks		1	0	1	0
b)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity of project Preparation including design of major highway Project (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above).	15	13	13	15	11
	<2 Project -0 marks		11	11	11	11
	2 Projects -11		2	2	4	0
	Add 2 mark for each additional project subject to maximum 4 marks.					
c)	Experience in position of Team Leader/Project Manager or similar capacity in Construction Supervision/IC involving length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6** laning) and above	20	20	20	20	20
	< 2 projects - 0		16	16	16	16
	2 Projects - 16		4	4	4	4
	Add 2 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 (four) marks					
d)	Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Operation and Maintenance of Major Highway (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above).	5	5	5	5	4
	1 project - 4 marks		4	4	4	4
	Add 1 mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 (one) marks		1	1	1	0
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	0	0
	< 1 year -0		0	0	0	0
	1 year -3		0			
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks		0			
	Total	100	89	88	91	88
	Weightage @ 12	12	10.68	10.56	10.92	10.56
			2	3	4	9

Resident Engineer Cum Highway Engineer - I							
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	2/10	3/10	4/10	9/10	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Jv with M/s ISAN Corporation	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd.	M/s MSV International Inc in Associates with M/s Designilla	Feedback Infra Private Limited in JV with M/s	
	Name of Key Personnel		Mr. Ajay Kumar	Mr. Ajit Kumar	Mr. Sayeed	Mr.	
	Date of Birth of KP's		20/11/1971	1/6/1963	1/7/1967	5/5/1970	
	Description		Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21	
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	
	II) Post Graduation in Transportation/Highway Engineering/Structural Engineering/Geotechnical Engineering	4	0	0	0	0	
2	Adequacy for the Project	70					
	Professional Experience						
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway projects	20	20	20	20	20	
	< 10 years -0						
i)	10 years -16		16	16	16	16	
	Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	4	4	4	
	Experience as Resident Engineer/Project Director/Project Manager/Superintending Engineer or equivalent/Executive Engineer or equivalent on construction works/Independent Engineer Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning*) and above)	20	20	20	20	20	
ii)	< 5 year -0						
	5 years -16		16	16	16	16	
	Add 1 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	4	4	4	
	Experience in similar capacity in handling major 2/4/6-laning** projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	25	25	25	24	25	
	< 2 nos -0						
iii)	2 nos -19		19	19	19	19	
	Add three marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 6 (Six) marks.		6	6	5	6	
	Experience in similar capacity of Highway Project of Construction/Construction Supervision/IC on PPP Mode (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	5	5	5	2.5	5	
iv)	2.5 marks for each project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks		5	5	2.5	5	
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	0	0	
	< 1 year -0		0	0	0	0	
3	1 year -3		0				
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks						
	Total	100	91	91	87.5	91	
	Weightage @ 3	3	2.73	2.73	2.625	2.73	
			2	3	4	9	

Annexure A

Annexure A

Resident Engineer Cum Highway Engineer -II							
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	2/10 M/s Chaifanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Jv with M/s ISAN Corporation	3/10 M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd.	4/10 M/s MSV International Inc in Associates with M/s Designilla	9/10 M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in JV with M/s SATRA SERVICES AND Mr. Rakesh	
	Name of the Applicant		Mr. NAND	Mr. Rakesh	Mr. Kumar	Mr. Rakesh	
	Name of Key Personnel		8/12/1978	3/7/1972	15/01/1969	8/7/1975	
	Date of Birth of KP's		Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	
	Description						
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	Associat e member provide more than 2 Key Professi onal	21	
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21		21	
	II) Post Graduation in Transportation/Highway Engineering/Structural Engineering/Geotechnical Engineering	4	0	0		0	
2	Adequacy for the Project	70					
	Professional Experience						
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway projects	20	20	20		20	20
	< 10 years -0						
i)	10 years -16		16	16		16	16
	Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	4		4	4
	Experience as Resident Engineer/Project Director/Project Manager/Superintending Engineer or equivalent/Executive Engineer or equivalent on construction works/Independent Engineer Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning*) and above)	20	20	20		20	20
ii)	< 5 year - 0						
	5 years -16		16	16		16	16
	Add 1 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	4		4	4
	Experience in similar capacity in handling major 2/4/6-laning** projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	25	25	25		25	25
	< 2 nos -0						
iii)	2 nos -19		19	19		19	19
	Add three marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 6 (Six) marks.		6	6		6	6
	Experience in similar capacity of Highway Project of Construction/Construction Supervision/IC on PPP Mode (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	5	5	5		5	5
iv)	2.5 marks for each project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks		5	5		5	5
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	5		0	0
	< 1 year -0						
3	1 year -3		0	3		0	0
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks		0	2		0	0
	Total	100	91	96	0	91	
	Weightage @ 3	3	2.73	2.88	0	2.73	
			2	3	4	9	

Bridge / Structural Engineer - I						
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	2/10 M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Jv with M/s ISAN Corporation	3/10 M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd.	4/10 M/s MSV International Inc in Associates with M/s Designilla	9/10 M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in JV with M/s SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS
	Name of the Applicant		Mr. Sunil	Mr. Mani shankar Pathak	Mr. Jainendra	Shiv Kumar
	Name of Key Personnel		16/05/1969	15/12/1959	1/10/1959	15/7/1969
	Date of Birth of KP's		Assessed		Assessed	Assessed
	Description					
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21
	II) Post Graduation in Structural Engineering	4	0	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70				
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/Bridge projects	15	14	15	15	15
i)	< 10 years -0					
	10 years -11		11	11	11	11
	Add one mark extra for each additional 2 year subject to maximum 4(four) marks.		3	4	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity in Design/Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridges/ROB/Flyover/Interchanges/any other such structures (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	20	20	20	20	20
ii)	< 5 years -0					
	5 years - 16		16	16	16	16
	Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	4	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Major Highway Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures	20	20	20	20	20
iii)	< 2 Bridges -0					
	2 Bridge -16		16	16	16	16
	Add 2 mark extra for each additional bridge subject to maximum 4 (four) marks		4	4	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Rehabilitation and repair of Major Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures	10	10	10	10	10
iv)	< 2 - 0					
	2 nos -07		7	7	7	7
	3 or more -10		3	3	3	3
	Experience in similar capacity of modern bridge construction technology viz., Precast Segmental, Balanced Cantilever Construction, Extradosed Bridge, Full Span Launching, Incremental Launching.	5	5	5	5	5
v)	Experience in 1 project - 4		4	4	4	4
	More than one project - 5 marks		1	1	1	1
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	5	0	0
	< 1 year -0		0			
3	1 year -3		0	3	0	0
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks			2	0	0
	Total	100	90	96	91	91
	Weightage @ 3	3	2.7	2.88	2.73	2.73
			2	3	4	9

Annexure A

Bridge / Structural Engineer - II						
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	2/10 M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in JV with M/s ISAN Corporation	3/10 M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd.	4/10 M/s MSV International Inc in Associates with M/s Designilla	9/10 M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in JV with M/s SATRA SERVICES AND SOLUTIONS ALOK Shekhar
	Name of the Applicant		Mr. Rajesh 25/12/1969 Assessed	Mr. Ravishankar 1/3/1977 Assessed	Mr. ANIL 22/01/1972 Assessed	25/11/1969 Assessed
	Name of Key Personnel					
	Date of Birth of KP's					
	Description					
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21
	II) Post Graduation in Structural Engineering	4	0	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70				
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/Bridge projects	15	15	15	15	15
	< 10 years -0					
i)	10 years -11		11	11	11	11
	Add one mark extra for each additional 2 year subject to maximum 4(four) marks.		4	4	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity in Design/Construction/Construction Supervision of Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/any other such structures (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	20	20	20	20	20
ii)	< 5 years -0					
	5 years - 16		16	16	16	16
	Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	4	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Major Highway Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures	20	20	20	20	20
iii)	< 2 Bridges -0					
	2 Bridge -16		16	16	16	16
	Add 2 mark extra for each additional bridge subject to maximum 4 (four) marks		4	4	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Rehabilitation and repair of Major Bridges/ROB/Flyover/ Interchanges/ any other structures	10	10	10	10	10
iv)	< 2 - 0					
	2 nos -07		7	7	7	7
	3 or more -10		3	3	3	3
	Experience in similar capacity of modern bridge construction technology viz., Precast Segmental, Balanced Cantilever Construction, Extradosed Bridge, Full Span Launching, Incremental Launching.	5	5	5	5	5
v)	Experience in 1 project - 4		4	4	4	4
	More than one project - 5 marks		1	1	1	1
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	3.5	5	0
	< 1 year -0					
3	1 year -3		0	3	3	0
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks			0.5	2	0
	Total	100	91	94.5	96	91
	Weightage @ 3	3	2.73	2.835	2.88	2.73
			2	3	4	9

Senior Pavement Specialists							
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	2/10	3/10	4/10	9/10	
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Jv with M/s ISAN Corporation	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd.	M/s MSV International Inc in Associates with M/s Designilla	Feedback Infra Private Limited in JV with M/s SATRA SERVICES	
			Name of Key Personnel	Mr. Anil	Mr. Shitanta	Mr. Shailendra	Rama Muni
			Date of Birth of KP's	15/06/1958	18/10/1982	5/6/1959	25/01/1970
			Description	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21	
i)	Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21	
ii)	Post Graduation in Transportation/Highway Engineering/Pavement engineering or equivalent	4	0	0	0	0	
2	Adequacy for the Project	70					
a)	Professional Experience						
i)	Total Professional Experience of Pavement Design/Construction and Maintenance of Highways/Roads/Air Field Runway	20	20	20	20	20	
	< 10 years -0						
	10 years -16		16	16	16	16	
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	4	4	4	
ii)	Experience in Similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of 2/4/6-laning** of major Highway Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	20	20	20	20	20	
	< 5 year - 0						
	5 years -16		16	16	16	16	
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	4	4	4	
iii)	Experience in similar capacity as Pavement/Geo-technical Engineer in construction/ construction supervision of Major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	20	20	20	20	20	
	< 2 nos - 0						
	2 nos - 16		16	16	16	16	
	Add 2 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 marks.		4	4	4	4	
iv)	Experience in similar capacity on major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) in innovative/non traditional technology and design	5	0	5	5	5	
	1 Project -4		0	4	4	4	
	2 or more -5		0	1	1	1	
v)	Experience in similar capacity on PPP Projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	5	5	5	2.5	5	
	2.5 marks for each project subject to maximum 5 (five) marks		5	5	2.5	5	
3	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	3	0	
	< 1 year -0		0				
	1 year -3			0	3	0	
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks						
	Total	100	86	91	91.5	91	
	Weightage @ 6	6	5.16	5.46	5.49	5.46	
			2	3	4	9	

Senior Quality cum Material Expert			2/10	3/10	4/10	9/10
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Jv with M/s ISAN Corporation	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd.	M/s MSV International Inc in Associates with M/s Designilla	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in JV with M/s SATRA SERVICES
	Name of the Applicant		Mr. Arvind	Mr. Niranjan	Mr. Pramod	Maithili
	Name of Key Personnel		18/01/1971	4/5/1971	11/8/1970	1/11/1969
	Date of Birth of KP's		Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed
	Description					
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21
	II) Post Graduation in Geotechnical Engineering/Foundation Engineering/Soil Mechanics/Rock Mechanics	4	0	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70				
	Professional Experience					
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/Bridge projects < 10 years -0	15	15	15	15	15
i)	10 years -11		11	11	11	11
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	4	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Supervision of major Highway Projects ((similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above))	25	25	25	25	25
ii)	< 5 year - 0					
	5 years -19		19	19	19	19
	Add 2.0 (two) marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 6 (six) marks.		6	6	6	6
	Experience in similar capacity in handling Similar Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	25	25	25	25	22
iii)	< 2 nos -0					
	2 nos -19		19	19	19	19
	Add 3.0 marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 6 (six) marks.		6	6	6	3
iv)	Experience in similar capacity on major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above) in innovative/non traditional technology	5	5	5	0	4
	1 Project -4		4	4	0	4
	2 or more -5		1	1	0	0
	Employment with the Firm	5	0	4.5	0	0
	< 1 year - 0		0			
3	1 year - 3			3	0	0
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks			1.5	0	0
	Total :	100	91	95.5	86	87
	Weightage @ 6	6	5.46	5.73	5.16	5.22
			2	3	4	9

Annexure A

Road Safety Expert						
S. No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks	2/10	3/10	4/10	9/10
	Name of the Applicant		M/s Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. in Jv with M/s ISAN Corporation	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd.	M/s MSV International Inc in Associates with M/s Designilla	M/s Feedback Infra Private Limited in JV with M/s SATRA SERVICES
			Mr. Neeraj	Mr. D. Udaya	Mr. Anuj	Satish NL
			15/09/1981	31/01/1984	18/08/1980	26/10/1977
			Assessed	Assessed	Assessed	Assessed
	Name of Key Personnel					
	Date of Birth of KP's					
	Description					
1	General Qualification	25	21	21	21	21
	I) Graduate in Civil Engineering	21	21	21	21	21
	II) Post Graduation in Traffic/Transportation/Safety Engineering or equivalent	4	0	0	0	0
2	Adequacy for the Project	70				
i)	Professional Experience					
	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/Bridge projects	15	14	13	15	15
	< 10 years -0					
	10 years -11		11	11	11	11
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		3	2	4	4
ii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety works on Major Highway Project (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above).	15	15	14	15	15
	> 5 Years-0					
	5 years -11		11	11	11	11
	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.		4	3	4	4
iii)	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Audits of 2/4/6-laning** Highway projects at different stages including at least one at design stage	20	20	20	20	20
	< 2 nos -0					
	2 nos -16		16	16	16	16
	Add 2 marks extra for each additional projects subject to maximum 4 marks.		4	4	4	4
	Experience in similar capacity in identification and improvement of black spots on Major Highway Project (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)	10	10	10	10	10
iv)	<2 nos. - 0 marks					
	2 nos. - 7 marks		7	7	7	7
	Add 1 marks extra for each additional improvement of black spots subject to maximum 3 marks.		3	3	3	3
	Experience in similar capacity of preparing Road Safety Management Plans for Inter Urban Highway	5	5	5	5	5
v)	1 project- 4 marks		4	4	4	4
	2 or more project- 5 marks		1	1	1	1
	Experience in similar capacity in field of Road Safety Management Plan	5	5	5	5	5
vi)	1 project- 4 marks		4	4	4	4
	2 or more project- 5 marks		1	1	1	1
	Employment with the Firm	5	5	5	0	4
3	< 1 year - 0					
	1 year - 3		3	3	0	3
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks		2	2	0	1
	Total :	100	95	93	91	95
	Weightage @ 4	4	3.8	3.72	3.64	3.8
			2	3	4	9