



भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण
(सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय)
National Highways Authority of India
(Ministry of Road Transport and Highways)
जी-5 एवं 6, सेक्टर-10, द्वारका, नई दिल्ली-110075
G-5 & 6, Sector-10, Dwarka, New Delhi-110075

दूरभाष / Phone : 91-11-25074100/25074200
फैक्स / Fax : 91-11-25093507 / 25093514

NHAI/BM/EC/AJ/Construction Supervision/Package-10

Dated: 31.12.2020

To

All Bidders (as per list enclosed)

Sub: Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of 6-lane access controlled Greenfield highway from km 67+000 to km 130+073 of Rajasthan/Gujarat Border to Santalpur section of NH-754K as a part of Amritsar-Jamnagar Economic Corridor in the State of Gujarat on EPC mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana (Phase-I) [AJ/Construction Supervision/Package-10] - **Opening of Financial Bids – Reg.**

Ref: (i) Bids submitted on 22.06.2020 for the above mentioned work.

Kindly refer NHAI letter dated 18.11.2020 vide which result of technical evaluation was uploaded on NIC portal and bidders were given opportunity to respond within seven days, in case of any objection.

2. The representations were received from below-mentioned 7 bidders:

Applicant No.	Name of Applicant
1/10	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Yongma Engineering Co. Ltd. and in association with Cho & Kim Engineering Pvt. Ltd.
3/10	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in association with Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd and PNT Designs Pvt. Ltd. Kota
5/10	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd. In JV with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd
6/10	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.
8/10	MSV International Inc. in Association with (as a sub-consultant) MSV International Tech Pvt. Ltd.
9/10	Centro de Estudios de Materiales y Control de Obra, SA in JV With ARKITECHNO Consultants (India) Pvt. Ltd. and in association with Civilbaba Infra Consultant Pvt. Ltd.
10/10	M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L. in association with TPF Engineering Pvt. Ltd.

Vineet

3. The representations as received have been examined by the constituted Evaluation Committee and reply to the representation as approved by Competent Authority is enclosed at Annexure- I.

4. In view of the above considerations, the result of technical evaluation is as under-

(i) Technical non-responsive firms

S. No.	Name of Firm	Original Result	Final Result	Remarks
1	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Yongma Engineering Co. Ltd. and in association with Cho & Kim Engineering Pvt. Ltd.	96.00	Non-responsive	Firm debarred by NHAI vide order dated 17.12.2020
2	M/s Geo Design and Research Pvt. Ltd. In JV with Almondz Global Infra-Consultant	Not-Qualified	Not-Qualified	Lead Partner failed in Minimum eligibility

(ii) Technical responsive firms along with their modified final technical scores

S. No.	Name of Firm	Original Technical Score	Final Technical Score
	Maximum Marks	100.00	100.00
1	M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in association with Upham International Corporation	96.09	96.09
2	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in association with Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd and PNT Designs Pvt. Ltd. Kota	97.08	97.32
3	M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. in JV with FP India Project Management Consultancy Services Pvt. Ltd.	94.40	94.40
4	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd. In JV with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd	95.59	95.80

View

S. No.	Name of Firm	Original Technical Score	Final Technical Score
5	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	91.03	91.03
6	MSV International Inc. in Association with (as a sub-consultant) MSV International Tech Pvt. Ltd.	95.68	95.68
7	Centro de Estudios de Materiales y Control de Obra, SA in JV With ARKITECHNO Consultants (India) Pvt. Ltd. and in association with Civilbaba Infra Consultant Pvt. Ltd.	82.49	82.49
8	M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L. in association with TPF Engineering Pvt. Ltd.	90.04	90.24

5. The financial bids of the technically responsive bidders mentioned in Para 5 above will be opened on **01.01.2021 at 1030 Hrs** in IT Training room, Ground Floor at NHAI (HQ). Accordingly, the bidders shall depute their representatives with authorization letter for attending the opening of financial bids.



(V. K. Joshi)
General Manager (Tech)
Bharatmala

Encl: As Above

Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for Supervision of Construction of 6-lane access controlled Greenfield highway from km 67+000 to km 130+073 of Rajasthan/Gujarat Border to Santalpur section of NH-754K as a part of Amritsar-Jamnagar Economic Corridor in the State of Gujarat on EPC mode under Bharatmala Pariyojana (Phase-I) [AJ/Construction Supervision/Package-10] - Opening of Financial Bids – Reg.

List of Bidders

S. No.	Name of Firm
1	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd. in JV with Yongma Engineering Co. Ltd. and in association with Cho & Kim Engineering Pvt. Ltd.
2	M/s SA Infrastructure Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in association with Upham International Corporation
3	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in association with Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd and PNT Designs Pvt. Ltd. Kota
4	M/s K & J Projects Pvt. Ltd. in JV with FP India Project Management Consultancy Services Pvt. Ltd.
5	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd. In JV with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd
6	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.
7	M/s Geo Design and Research Pvt. Ltd. In JV with Almondz Global Infra-Consultant
8	MSV International Inc. in Association with (as a sub-consultant) MSV International Tech Pvt. Ltd.
9	Centro de Estudios de Materiales y Control de Obra, SA in JV With ARKITECHNO Consultants (India) Pvt. Ltd. and in association with Civilbaba Infra Consultant Pvt. Ltd.
10	M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L. in association with TPF Engineering Pvt. Ltd.

Vineel

Annex-I

S. No.	Firm's Representation	Committee's Reply
A.	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd.	
1	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer: Shri Ram Narayana Singh 1) "Post-Graduation in Management/ Construction/ Transportation/ Highway Engineering/ Structural Engineering or equivalent specialized stream of civil engineering" M. Tech. (Soil Mechanics & Foundation Engineering) – 2016 Marks Assessed in Evaluation – 0 Marks Re-evaluated by firm – 4 2) "Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Operation and Maintenance of Major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**))" Ref. I.P. no. 14, Lane: 4, Length: 73.5 Km (Ref. bid page no. 1306) Marks Assessed in Evaluation – 0 Marks Re-evaluated by firm – 4 Resident cum Highway Engineer - Ravi V 2 (b) "Experience in similar capacity of Highway Project of Construction/ Construction Supervision/ IC on EPC Mode (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)" Ref. I.P. no. 20 (ref. bid page no. 1349) Marks Assessed in Evaluation – 0 Marks Re-evaluated by firm – 4	As per NHAI order No. NHAI/JH/SC/RRJ/NH-33/2019/106 dated 17.12.2020 M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd. has been debarred from the bidding process to be undertaken by NHAI for a period of 2 years. In view of the above debarment order dated 17.12.2020 the bidder is considered non-responsive.



B.	M/s LEA Associates South Asia Pvt. Ltd. in association with Pioneer Infra Consultants Pvt. Ltd and PNT Designs Pvt. Ltd. Kota																						
1	Team Leader cum Sr. Highway Engineer – Shri Uday Thangan 2. <i>c“Experience in position of Team Leader/Proect Manager or similar capacity in construction supersion/IC involving length 40 % of Project Length or of similar configuration (4/6 laning*** and above)”</i> Proposed Team Leader cum Sr. Highway Engineer has handled 3 nos. of Highway Projects in similar capacity and length more than 40% of Project length (INFRACON Sl. No. P10, P11 & P18). Therefore, we would like to request you to kindly consider his experience. Hence, he is eligible to get “18” marks out of “20” as per our evaluation. Please refer page no. 1003 to 1006, 1016, 1017, 1024, 1030 to 1032, 1039 & 1040 of Technical Proposal as Annex-I.	Bidder's representation has been considered and the marks are increased from 16(earlier) to 18 for the sub-category. As a result of the above modifications, the total marks awarded to the CV of Road Safety Expert have been increased from 88 (earlier) to 90. In view of the above modification in scores, the updated technical score of the firm is given below: <table border="1" data-bbox="943 819 1437 1249"> <thead> <tr> <th>S. No.</th><th>Description</th><th>Marks assessed earlier</th><th>Marks assessed Now</th></tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1</td><td>Firm Experience</td><td>40.00</td><td>40.00</td></tr> <tr> <td>2</td><td>Use of Technology</td><td>20.00</td><td>20.00</td></tr> <tr> <td>3</td><td>Key Personnel</td><td>37.08</td><td>37.32</td></tr> <tr> <td></td><td>Total</td><td>97.08</td><td>97.32</td></tr> </tbody> </table>		S. No.	Description	Marks assessed earlier	Marks assessed Now	1	Firm Experience	40.00	40.00	2	Use of Technology	20.00	20.00	3	Key Personnel	37.08	37.32		Total	97.08	97.32
S. No.	Description	Marks assessed earlier	Marks assessed Now																				
1	Firm Experience	40.00	40.00																				
2	Use of Technology	20.00	20.00																				
3	Key Personnel	37.08	37.32																				
	Total	97.08	97.32																				
C.	M/s Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd. In JV with Chaitanya Projects Consultancy Pvt. Ltd																						
1	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer Mr. Durvesh Kumar Tyagi 2. <i>b) Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity of Project Preparation including Design of Major Highway Projects (of Length 40 % of Project Length or of similar configuration (4/6 laning*** and above))”</i> Please refer infracon Sr. Nos. in portal Given below 4 projects qualify for the said category: Sr. no. – 5 Feb 2000 to Feb 2003 as a Team Leader. – DPR Project Sr. no. – 8 march 2003 to Jan 2005 as a Resident Engineer- DPR Project Sr.No.- 20 March 2012 to Aug 2013 as Team Leader. -	2. <i>b) Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity of Project Preparation including Design of Major Highway Projects (of Length 40 % of Project Length or of similar configuration (4/6 laning*** and above))”</i> It was found that there is a mismatch between the information and documentation provided on INFRACON for Project at S. No. 5 , hence the project is not considered. In view of above, the marks awarded for this sub-																					

	DPR Project Sr.No.- 24 June 2014 to Nov. 2015 as a Team Leader.- DPR Project The input of the personnel on the above projects is more than 9 months. Hence 4 no. of projects in DPR. Therefore request to consider 15 marks 2. d) "Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Operation and Maintenance of Major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**))" Please refer infracon Sr.Nos.14 and 23 in portal - 2 projects qualify for the said category The input of the personnel on the above projects is more than 12 months. Hence 2 no. of projects in O&M. Therefore request to consider 5 marks	criterion shall remain unchanged. 2. d) "Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity in Operation and Maintenance of Major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**))" The project that is already considered for the sub-criterion 2(c), (Construction Supervision/IC) cannot be in the O&M phase for the same period, hence not considered. In view of above, the marks awarded for this sub-criterion shall remain unchanged
2	Senior Pavement Specialist - Mr. Rajesh Rajaram Rathor "Experience in Similar Capacity in Construction/ Construction Supervision of 2/4/6-laning** of major Highway Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning*) and above)" As per Appendix-EC no.3.4 of RFP for Experience in Similar capacity on behalf of Government Executive Engineer can consider Mr. Rajesh Rathor is retired Executive Engineer Mr. Rajesh Rathor has worked as Executive Engineer from August 2013 to January 2018 – 4 years and 5 months And as Highway cum pavement engineer from March 2018 to till date – 2 yrs 2 months (date of bid). Total – 6 years 7 months (Considering Infracon Project SI no: 15 to 21). Hence requesting to consider 15+1 = 16 marks	"Experience in Similar Capacity in Construction/ Construction Supervision of 2/4/6-laning** of major Highway Projects (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning*) and above)" In view of the representation of the bidder, the experience as Executive Engineer from August 2013 to January 2018 has been considered, which 4 years and 5 months is. However, the experience from March 2018 till the date of bid is not considered eligible as experience in a Project Management Consultancy work is not considered. This results in total experience in similar capacity in construction / construction supervision to be less than 5 years. Therefore, no marks have been awarded in this sub-category

Vein

<i>“Experience in similar capacity as Pavement/Geo-technical Engineer in construction/ construction supervision of Major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)”</i> Mr. Rajesh Rathore has worked as Executive Engineer (Similar Capacity) for following (Infracon Portal Sr. No.) Sr. No. 15 – 49.43Kms (4 Lane) Sr. No. 17. - 118 Kms (2 lane) – Conversion to 4 lane (47.20 Km) Sr.No. 18 – 127 Kms . (2 lane) – Conversion to 4 Lane (50.80 Km). Sr. No. 20 – 120 Kms (2 Lane)- Conversion to 4 lane (48.00 Km) Sr. No 21 – 13.30 kms (2 Lane) Conversion to 4 Lane (5.20 Kms) + 19.4 Km = 24.60 km 5 No. of projects meet the criteria specified in the RFP hence 20+5 = 25 marks Projects shall be considered. “Employment with the Firm” Please refer infracon Sr.Nos.21 in portal 1 projects qualify for the said category Sr. no. – 21 March 2018 to Till Date as a Highway cum Pavement Engineer at KDMC project from Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd The input of the personnel on the above projects is more than 2 Years and 3 months. Therefore, request to consider 3.5 marks.	<i>“Experience in similar capacity as Pavement/Geo-technical Engineer in construction/ construction supervision of Major Highway projects (of length 40% of project length or more of similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)”</i> In view of the representation of the bidder, the projects at S. No. 15, 17, and 20 were already considered eligible. However, Project at S. No. 18 is not considered eligible as the mentioned stretch does not belong to NH /SH category Therefore, the marks awarded to the key personnel shall remain unchanged in this sub-category “Employment with the Firm” Mr. Rajaram Rathore has worked for Dhruv Consultancy Services Ltd from 01 March 2018 till date, which sum up to 2 years 3 months up to the bid due date. Therefore, 3.5 marks are awarded to the key personnel in this sub-category. In view of above, the total marks of the key personnel have been increased from 68.5 (earlier) to 72. In view of the above modification in scores, the updated technical score of the firm is given below: <table><tr><th>S. No.</th><th>Description</th><th>Marks assessed earlier</th><th>Marks assessed Now</th></tr><tr><td>1</td><td>Firm Experience</td><td>40.00</td><td>40.00</td></tr><tr><td>2</td><td>Use of Technology</td><td>20.00</td><td>20.00</td></tr><tr><td>3</td><td>Key Personnel</td><td>35.59</td><td>35.80</td></tr><tr><td></td><td>Total</td><td>95.59</td><td>95.80</td></tr></table>	S. No.	Description	Marks assessed earlier	Marks assessed Now	1	Firm Experience	40.00	40.00	2	Use of Technology	20.00	20.00	3	Key Personnel	35.59	35.80		Total	95.59	95.80
S. No.	Description	Marks assessed earlier	Marks assessed Now																		
1	Firm Experience	40.00	40.00																		
2	Use of Technology	20.00	20.00																		
3	Key Personnel	35.59	35.80																		
	Total	95.59	95.80																		

Venil

D.	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd.	
1	Category "Relevant experience for the assignment" In hand DPRs for NHAI's Highway/Bridge/Tunnel Projects 1. DPR for Rajpura-Kharar New Greenfield Highway Project connecting NH-44 in the state of Punjab (page 225 to 230) 2. Six Laning of Panipat – Jalandhar Section of NH-1 from km 96.00 to km 387.00 in the state of Haryana and Punjab (page 231 to 237) 3. DPR of Newly declared NH-321G in Uttar Pradesh - Agra-Jalesar-Etah (page 238 to 263) 4. DPR of for Ploadpur (NH-66) – Mahabaleshwaram – Panchgam – Wai on NH – 48 ii. Saralgaon near NH-61 - Bhaimshankar - Wafda - Khed Package NHA/ITR/15). (page 264-273) 5. Project Management including Feasibility Study/DPR of selected road stretches/corridors for up gradation to two/four lane NH configuration under Bharatmala Pariyojana – Packages No. NHA/IM/9 (page no. 274 to 279) 6. DPR of 4 laning of Pirpanti to Hansdiha section NH 133 (page 280-289) 7. DPR of 4 laning of Palma to Gumla Section NH 23 (page 290 – 304B) 8. DPR of 4 laning of Kuru to Nagar Untari Section NH 75 (page 305 – 316B) 9. PM including DPR for NH 340C Kurnool-Naditkor-Atmakur-Domala in Andhra Pradesh (page no. 317 – 326) 10. PM including DPR for Panipat-Shamli-Muzaffarnagar-Bijnor-Nagina road (page 327 – 334)	With reference to the representation made by the bidder, the projects were reviewed and Projects no. 1, 3, 6, 7, and 8 were already considered eligible. For other projects have not been considered due to following reasons: - - providing clarification for already submitted deliverables has not been considered as proof of ongoing DPR. - For projects where EOT recommendation have expired before bid due date the same have not been considered. - IE Projects under its Operation and Maintenance Phase has not been considered for ongoing DPR Hence, the marks awarded under the concerned category shall remain unchanged.



2	Category : Experience in use technology for road inspection <i>“Experience in Network Survey Vehicle (NSV) or better technology for pavement inspection”</i> .We have been awarded 2.00 marks out of maximum 3.00 marks under this sub category while we have attached 16 experience certificates of firm as detailed below along with our Technical Proposal. <table><tr><th>S. No.</th><th>Certificate Details</th></tr><tr><td>1</td><td>11224/RO-Raipur/End of Durg Bypass to CG/MH border/ L.N.Malviya/3264 dated 19.07.2019</td></tr><tr><td>2</td><td>11175/RO-Raipur/Raipur-Aurang/ L.N.Malviya/3265 dated 19.07.2019</td></tr><tr><td>3</td><td>11175/RO-Raipur/Raipur-Aurang/ L.N.Malviya/3266 dated 19.07.2019</td></tr><tr><td>4</td><td>11175/RO-Raipur/Raipur-Aurang/ L.N.Malviya/3267 dated 19.07.2019</td></tr><tr><td>5</td><td>11175/RO-Raipur/Raipur-Aurang/ L.N.Malviya/3268 dated 19.07.2019</td></tr><tr><td>6</td><td>11175/RO-Raipur/Raipur-Aurang/ L.N.Malviya/3269 dated 19.07.2019</td></tr><tr><td>7</td><td>11121/RO-Raipur/Durg Bypass/ L.N.Malviya/3270 dated 19.07.2019</td></tr><tr><td>8</td><td>SE NHC/Tender/1821/2017-18 dated 21/12/2017</td></tr><tr><td>9</td><td>SE NHC/Tender/1819/2017-18 dated 21/12/2017</td></tr><tr><td>10</td><td>1205/NH Zone/DPR P-III/01/2017-18 Bhopal dated 10/08/2018</td></tr><tr><td>11</td><td>1206/NH Zone/DPR P-VII/01/ 2017-18 Bhopal dated 10/08/2018</td></tr><tr><td>12</td><td>NH-2017/02/DE-7/C.R.No.11/ ENGG/089 DATED 03/10/2018</td></tr><tr><td>13</td><td>NH-2017/02/DE-7/C.R.No.11/ ENGG/090</td></tr></table>	S. No.	Certificate Details	1	11224/RO-Raipur/End of Durg Bypass to CG/MH border/ L.N.Malviya/3264 dated 19.07.2019	2	11175/RO-Raipur/Raipur-Aurang/ L.N.Malviya/3265 dated 19.07.2019	3	11175/RO-Raipur/Raipur-Aurang/ L.N.Malviya/3266 dated 19.07.2019	4	11175/RO-Raipur/Raipur-Aurang/ L.N.Malviya/3267 dated 19.07.2019	5	11175/RO-Raipur/Raipur-Aurang/ L.N.Malviya/3268 dated 19.07.2019	6	11175/RO-Raipur/Raipur-Aurang/ L.N.Malviya/3269 dated 19.07.2019	7	11121/RO-Raipur/Durg Bypass/ L.N.Malviya/3270 dated 19.07.2019	8	SE NHC/Tender/1821/2017-18 dated 21/12/2017	9	SE NHC/Tender/1819/2017-18 dated 21/12/2017	10	1205/NH Zone/DPR P-III/01/2017-18 Bhopal dated 10/08/2018	11	1206/NH Zone/DPR P-VII/01/ 2017-18 Bhopal dated 10/08/2018	12	NH-2017/02/DE-7/C.R.No.11/ ENGG/089 DATED 03/10/2018	13	NH-2017/02/DE-7/C.R.No.11/ ENGG/090	It was mentioned in the declaration of results of the Technical Evaluation that the projects in which the category of 'use of technology' was not included in the scope of consultancy services for highway and for the project certificates issued by state agencies where LoA was issued before 01.01.2017 shall not be considered. In view of above, the certificates at S. No. 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13 and 14 are NOT considered eligible. Further, Certificates at S. No. 2, 3, 5 and 6 refer to the same contract, hence, considered one single project experience. Similarly, Certificates at S. No. 4 and 7 refer to the same contract hence, considered one single project experience. Apart from this, certificates at S. No. 1, 15 and 16 were already considered eligible for NSV experience. Therefore, the firm has 5 eligible projects as experience in usage of NSV. Thus, the marks awarded shall remain unchanged.
S. No.	Certificate Details																													
1	11224/RO-Raipur/End of Durg Bypass to CG/MH border/ L.N.Malviya/3264 dated 19.07.2019																													
2	11175/RO-Raipur/Raipur-Aurang/ L.N.Malviya/3265 dated 19.07.2019																													
3	11175/RO-Raipur/Raipur-Aurang/ L.N.Malviya/3266 dated 19.07.2019																													
4	11175/RO-Raipur/Raipur-Aurang/ L.N.Malviya/3267 dated 19.07.2019																													
5	11175/RO-Raipur/Raipur-Aurang/ L.N.Malviya/3268 dated 19.07.2019																													
6	11175/RO-Raipur/Raipur-Aurang/ L.N.Malviya/3269 dated 19.07.2019																													
7	11121/RO-Raipur/Durg Bypass/ L.N.Malviya/3270 dated 19.07.2019																													
8	SE NHC/Tender/1821/2017-18 dated 21/12/2017																													
9	SE NHC/Tender/1819/2017-18 dated 21/12/2017																													
10	1205/NH Zone/DPR P-III/01/2017-18 Bhopal dated 10/08/2018																													
11	1206/NH Zone/DPR P-VII/01/ 2017-18 Bhopal dated 10/08/2018																													
12	NH-2017/02/DE-7/C.R.No.11/ ENGG/089 DATED 03/10/2018																													
13	NH-2017/02/DE-7/C.R.No.11/ ENGG/090																													

Verul

	DATED 03/10/2018 14 1210/PWD (NH)/DPR P-IV/01/ 2017 Bhopal dated 10/08/2018 15 NHAI/PIU-Rtk/B-H/IE/O&M/3585 dated 03/12/2019 16 NHAI/PIU-Rtk/Rtk-Hsr/NH-10/LTR/19-20/3582 dated 13/12/2019	
E.	M/s MSV International Inc. in Association with (as a sub-consultant) MSV International Tech Pvt. Ltd.	
1.	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer – Shri Abdhesh Kumar Singh 1. “II) Post-Graduation in Management/ Construction/ Transportation/Highway Engineering/Structural Engineering or equivalent specialised stream of civil engineering” 2. b) “Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity of Project Preparation including Design of Major Highway Projects (of Length 40 % of Project Length or of similar configuration (4/6 laning***) and above)” P- 06 & 08(certificates are enclosed)	1. II) Post-Graduation in Management/ Construction/ Transportation/Highway Engineering/Structural Engineering or equivalent specialised stream of civil engineering” The degree submitted by bidder in their representation is not equivalent to specialized stream of civil engineering. Therefore, marks shall remain unchanged in this sub-category. 2. Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity of Project Preparation including Design of Major Highway Projects (of Length 40 % of Project Length or of similar configuration (4/6 laning***) and above)” The primary position assigned to the key personnel in the mentioned projects is not equivalent to the similar capacity of Team Leader hence, not considered. Therefore, the marks awarded shall remain unchanged in this sub-criterion.
F.	M/s Centro de Estudios de Materiales y Control de Obra, SA in JV With ARKITECHNO Consultants (India) Pvt. Ltd. and in association with Introsoft Solutions	

Handwritten signature

"Evaluation Criteria for Assessment of Experience in use of Technology for road technology"

1.2 Experience in Network Survey Vehicle (NSV) or better technology for pavement inspection.

Project No.	Company Name	Refer Page No.
1	CEMOSA	830-843
2	CEMOSA	844-853
3	CEMOSA	854-897
4	CEMOSA	898-935
5	CEMOSA	936-945
6	CEMOSA	946-961
7	ARKITECHNO	962-965
8	ARKITECHNO	966-968
9	ARKITECHNO	969-971

2.2 Experience in FWD or better technology for strength measurement

Project No.	Company Name	Refer Page No.
1	CEMOSA	830-843
2	CEMOSA	844-853
3	CEMOSA	854-897
4	CEMOSA	898-935
5	CEMOSA	936-945
6	CEMOSA	946-961
7	ARKITECHNO	962-965
8	ARKITECHNO	966-968
9	ARKITECHNO	969-971

3.2 Experience in MBIU or better technology for bridge inspection.

Project No.	Company Name	Refer Page No.
4	CEMOSA	898-935
5	CEMOSA	936-945
6	CEMOSA	946-961
7	ARKITECHNO	962-965
8	ARKITECHNO	966-968
9	ARKITECHNO	969-971

4.2 Experience in Retroreflectometer Technology

ARKITECHNO Consultants (India) Pvt. Ltd.

It was mentioned in the declaration of results of the Technical Evaluation

that the projects in which the category of 'use of technology' was not included in the scope of consultancy services for highway and for the project certificates issued by state agencies where LoA was issued before 01.01.2017 shall not be considered."

In view of above, the project submitted claiming experience in use of Technology for field investing as submitted by ARKITECHNO Consultants (India) Pvt. Ltd. are not considered as eligible.

CEMOSA

In view of the representation of the bidder

Project No. 3 and 6

The experience for civil works at S. No. 3 and 6 was certified by the Authority of State Roads in Eastern Andalucia.

However, the certificate for Technology for Road Inspection was provided by the Authority of State Roads in Castilla and Eastern Leon.

In view of certification by authorities from different states for the same work, there appears to be a discrepancy. Hence, these projects are not considered.

Project at S. No. 4 has not been considered as the certification is not issued by government agency, but by a private firm namely Constructora MECO, Panama.

Projects at S. No. 1, 2 and 5 were already considered to be eligible.

Vered

	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Project No.</th><th>Company Name</th><th>Refer Page No.</th></tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr><td>1</td><td>CEMOSA</td><td>830-843</td></tr> <tr><td>2</td><td>CEMOSA</td><td>844-853</td></tr> <tr><td>3</td><td>CEMOSA</td><td>854-897</td></tr> <tr><td>4</td><td>CEMOSA</td><td>898-935</td></tr> <tr><td>5</td><td>CEMOSA</td><td>936-945</td></tr> <tr><td>6</td><td>CEMOSA</td><td>946-961</td></tr> <tr><td>7</td><td>ARKITECHNO</td><td>962-965</td></tr> <tr><td>8</td><td>ARKITECHNO</td><td>966-968</td></tr> <tr><td>9</td><td>ARKITECHNO</td><td>969-971</td></tr> </tbody> </table>	Project No.	Company Name	Refer Page No.	1	CEMOSA	830-843	2	CEMOSA	844-853	3	CEMOSA	854-897	4	CEMOSA	898-935	5	CEMOSA	936-945	6	CEMOSA	946-961	7	ARKITECHNO	962-965	8	ARKITECHNO	966-968	9	ARKITECHNO	969-971	In view of above, the score of the firm shall remain unchanged.
Project No.	Company Name	Refer Page No.																														
1	CEMOSA	830-843																														
2	CEMOSA	844-853																														
3	CEMOSA	854-897																														
4	CEMOSA	898-935																														
5	CEMOSA	936-945																														
6	CEMOSA	946-961																														
7	ARKITECHNO	962-965																														
8	ARKITECHNO	966-968																														
9	ARKITECHNO	969-971																														
G.	M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L. in association with TPF Engineering Pvt. Ltd.																															
1	With reference to result of Technical Evaluation of Bids as per your office letter under reference (2) above. We have reviewed the evaluation and found that the marks given to our firm are very less as compared to our self-evaluation. However, we are providing our point wise justification and request you to kindly consider the points and revise the technical score. Evaluation Criteria for Assessment of Experience of the Firm. <i>"In hand DPRs of Highway/Bridge/Tunnel Projects (presently under progress)"</i> We have 14 Nos. of in hand DPR projects of NHAI, MoRTH & Central Government/State Government Authority. Refer Pg. No. 644 to 649 of our submitted proposal. Hence we must get 10 marks in this criteria.	The mentioned criterion in the clause 1 of Appendix EC of the RFP is: <i>"In hand DPRs of NHAI's Highway/Bridge/Tunnel Projects (presently under progress)"</i> i.e. only the ongoing DPR works for NHAI shall be considered. <2 – 0 marks 2-5 – 5 marks >5 – 10 marks Your proposal contained 4 ongoing DPR projects for NHAI, out of which 2 (project No. 1 and 3) were already considered eligible. Project no. 2 was awarded on 15.02.2016. As we mentioned in the declaration of technical results of the bid : <i>All NHAI projects awarded since 01.01.2017 shall be considered. However, for NHAI projects awarded before 01.01.2017, only those projects shall be considered: -</i> (i) <i>Projects where EOT has been granted till bid due date.</i> (ii) <i>Projects where recent documents showing directions/communication issued from NHAI have been enclosed by the bidder, establishing that DPR is ongoing.</i>																														

View

		Therefore, Project no. 2 is not considered eligible for ongoing NHAI DPR. Project No. 4 – Preparation of Report on Physical Condition of the National Highways stretches under consideration for award on Toll Operate Transfer (TOT) model Bundel-5 is NOT a DPR project, hence not considered for evaluation. Accordingly, 5 marks out of 10 had already been allotted. Hence,. The marks shall remain unchanged for this category.																								
2	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer – Mr. Mohan Ande <i>"2) b) Experience as Team Leader or similar capacity of Project Preparation including Design of Major Highway Projects (of Length 40 % of Project Length or of similar configuration (4/6 laning***) and above)"</i> Mr. Mohan Ande has done 3 Projects of DPR in similar capacity. Refer Project Nos. 12, 13, & 17 and Pg. Nos. 371, 372 & 376 respectively for each project, of our submitted proposal. Hence he must get 13 marks in this criteria.	In view of the representation of the bidder, the projects related to Project management consultancy works and where the road stretch belongs to non-NH / non –SH category or are unspecified, are not considered. In view of the above, the marks awarded in the mentioned sub-criterion shall remain unchanged.																								
3.1	Road Safety Expert – Mr. Manish Agrawal <i>"1-II) Post-Graduation in Traffic/ Transportation/ Safety Engineering or equivalent. Mr. Manish Agrawal has completed his M.Tech. in Transportation Engineering."</i> Refer Pg. Nos. 616 - 620 of Vol-2 of submitted technical proposal. Hence he must get 4 marks in this criteria	Post Graduation Post Graduation degree is from a non AICTE-approved institution, therefore, marks are not awarded.																								
3.2	<i>"2-ii) Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety works on Major Highway Project (similar configuration (2/4/6 laning**) and above)."</i> Qualifying Projects and experience is illustrated as below: <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Project No.</th><th>Duration</th><th>Total Experience</th></tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1</td><td>13/07/1999-10/07/2002</td><td>3 Years</td></tr> <tr> <td>3</td><td>12/03/2004-25/06/2005</td><td>1 Year 4</td></tr> <tr> <td>5</td><td>05/04/2004-30/06/2005</td><td>Months</td></tr> <tr> <td>6</td><td>01/06/2005-30/08/2006</td><td>2 Years 4</td></tr> <tr> <td>10</td><td>01/09/2006-30/09/2007</td><td>Months</td></tr> <tr> <td>12</td><td>09/06/2009-25/08/2011</td><td>2 Years 3 M</td></tr> <tr> <td>16</td><td>05/10/2011-19/06/2012</td><td>3 Years 3</td></tr> </tbody> </table>	Project No.	Duration	Total Experience	1	13/07/1999-10/07/2002	3 Years	3	12/03/2004-25/06/2005	1 Year 4	5	05/04/2004-30/06/2005	Months	6	01/06/2005-30/08/2006	2 Years 4	10	01/09/2006-30/09/2007	Months	12	09/06/2009-25/08/2011	2 Years 3 M	16	05/10/2011-19/06/2012	3 Years 3	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety works on Major Highway Project The Projects in which : 1. The mentioned stretch is NOT a major highway project or is NOT clearly specified. 2. Work is related to minor maintenance work. 3. Work is not a highway project. 4. The role of the key personnel is not as Road Safety Expert or similar capacity/ does not include road safety works. 5. Work is a project management consultancy.
Project No.	Duration	Total Experience																								
1	13/07/1999-10/07/2002	3 Years																								
3	12/03/2004-25/06/2005	1 Year 4																								
5	05/04/2004-30/06/2005	Months																								
6	01/06/2005-30/08/2006	2 Years 4																								
10	01/09/2006-30/09/2007	Months																								
12	09/06/2009-25/08/2011	2 Years 3 M																								
16	05/10/2011-19/06/2012	3 Years 3																								

Veri

	19	09/11/2011-25/07/2012	Months	are not considered eligible. The total experience in similar capacity, in Road Safety Works on Major Highway Projects comes out to be 5 years 5 months , (Project no. 16 to 34), which is equivalent to 11 marks in the corresponding sub-criterion. Therefore, marks shall remain unchanged for the mentioned sub-criterion
	20	16/11/2011-17/07/2012		
	21	14/12/2011-19/03/2012		
	22	15/02/2012-25/12/2012		
	24	17/07/2012-13/11/2013		
	25	11/12/2012-20/03/2014		
	27	15/12/2013-30/12/2014		
	30	15/01/2015-20/06/2015	5 Years 7 Months (considered till July 2020)	
	31	01/07/2015-25/09/2015		
	32	01/10/2015-30/12/2015		
	34	06/01/2016-15/12/2018		
	35	25/07/2016-30/12/2018		
	36	01/06/2017-till date		
	37	03/07/2017-till date		
	Total Experience			

3.3	"2-iii) Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Audits of 2/4/6- laning** highway projects at different stages including at least one at design stage: Mr. Manish Agrawal has total 14 projects experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Audits. <table><tr><th>Project No.</th><th>Project stage</th><th>Page No.</th></tr><tr><td>3</td><td>Supervision</td><td>551</td></tr><tr><td>5</td><td>Supervision</td><td>555</td></tr><tr><td>6</td><td>Supervision</td><td>557</td></tr><tr><td>8</td><td>Supervision</td><td>561</td></tr><tr><td>10</td><td>Supervision</td><td>564</td></tr><tr><td>12</td><td>Supervision</td><td>567</td></tr><tr><td>15</td><td>Supervision</td><td>571</td></tr><tr><td>16</td><td>Supervision</td><td>573</td></tr><tr><td>21</td><td>Supervision</td><td>582</td></tr><tr><td>22</td><td>DPR</td><td>584</td></tr><tr><td>27</td><td>Supervision</td><td>594</td></tr><tr><td>33</td><td>Supervision</td><td>602</td></tr><tr><td>36</td><td>Supervision</td><td>608</td></tr><tr><td>37</td><td>DPR</td><td>610</td></tr></table>	Project No.	Project stage	Page No.	3	Supervision	551	5	Supervision	555	6	Supervision	557	8	Supervision	561	10	Supervision	564	12	Supervision	567	15	Supervision	571	16	Supervision	573	21	Supervision	582	22	DPR	584	27	Supervision	594	33	Supervision	602	36	Supervision	608	37	DPR	610	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Audits of 2/4/6 laning. Bidder's representation has been considered and the marks are increased from 15(earlier) to 20 for the sub-category. As a result of the above modifications, the total marks awarded to the CV of Road Safety Expert have been increased from 87 (earlier) to 92. In view of the above modification in scores, the updated technical score of the firm is given below: <table><tr><th>S. No.</th><th>Description</th><th>Marks assessed earlier</th><th>Marks assessed Now</th></tr><tr><td>1</td><td>Firm Experience</td><td>35.00</td><td>35.00</td></tr><tr><td>2</td><td>Use of Technology</td><td>20.00</td><td>20.00</td></tr><tr><td>3</td><td>Key Personnel</td><td>35.04</td><td>35.24</td></tr><tr><td></td><td>Total</td><td>90.04</td><td>90.24</td></tr></table> Signature Not Verified	S. No.	Description	Marks assessed earlier	Marks assessed Now	1	Firm Experience	35.00	35.00	2	Use of Technology	20.00	20.00	3	Key Personnel	35.04	35.24		Total	90.04	90.24
Project No.	Project stage	Page No.																																																																	
3	Supervision	551																																																																	
5	Supervision	555																																																																	
6	Supervision	557																																																																	
8	Supervision	561																																																																	
10	Supervision	564																																																																	
12	Supervision	567																																																																	
15	Supervision	571																																																																	
16	Supervision	573																																																																	
21	Supervision	582																																																																	
22	DPR	584																																																																	
27	Supervision	594																																																																	
33	Supervision	602																																																																	
36	Supervision	608																																																																	
37	DPR	610																																																																	
S. No.	Description	Marks assessed earlier	Marks assessed Now																																																																
1	Firm Experience	35.00	35.00																																																																
2	Use of Technology	20.00	20.00																																																																
3	Key Personnel	35.04	35.24																																																																
	Total	90.04	90.24																																																																

Signature Not Verified

Digitally signed by V K JOSHI
Date: 2020.12.31 16:32:46 IST
Location: eProcurement System for Central PSUs