



भारतीय राष्ट्रीय राजमार्ग प्राधिकरण
(सड़क परिवहन और राजमार्ग मंत्रालय)
National Highways Authority of India
(Ministry of Road Transport and Highways)
जी-5 एवं 6, सेक्टर-10, द्वारका, नई दिल्ली-110075
G-5 & 6, Sector-10, Dwarka, New Delhi-110075

दूरभाष / Phone : 91-11-25074100/25074200
फैक्स / Fax : 91-11-25093507 / 25093514

NHAI/1101/RSC/RS Advocacy/2018/ E-1925/1706

Date: 10.07.2020

Sub: Consultancy Services for Project Preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of Road Safety Advocacy Park at Kanyakumari-End Point (at Km 234/170 of NH-7) in the State of Tamil Nadu (3rd Call) - **Technical Bid Evaluation Result-Reg.**

Ref.: RFP received up to 25.06.2020.

Dear Sirs

As per Clause 12.3 of Data Sheet of LOI of RFP, Technical Evaluation sheets of Firms and Key personnel are enclosed as under.

2. In view of the above, if there is any discrepancy in the aforementioned results/sheets, same may be brought to the notice of the undersigned by 17.07.2020 upto 17.00 Hrs.

Thanking you

Yours faithfully,

(R.K. Singh)
General Manager (Tech) TN

Project - Consultancy Services for Project Preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of Road Safety Advocacy Park at Kanyakumari-End Point (at Km 234/170 of NH-7) in the State of Tamil Nadu (3rd Call)

List of the Applicants:-

Applicant No:-	Name of the Applicant	INFRACON ID	Status of the Applicant Sole/JV/ Association
1/3	M/s Balaji & Associates	2020-1273-37987_5335	Sole Proprietor
2/3	M/s Mukesh & Associates	2020-1273-82_69747	Sole
3/3	M/s STUP Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with Stup Design Forum	2020-1273-184_6713	Association

Project - Consultancy Services for Project Preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of Road Safety Advocacy Park at Kanyakumari-End Point (at Km 234/170 of NH-7) in the State of Tamil Nadu (3rd Call)

Stage I - Proof of eligibility

S. No.	Name of the Firm	Status of the Applicant Sole/JV/ Association	Forwarding letter for Proof of Eligibility in the Form-E1.	Firm's relevant experience and performance in last 7 years	Firm's turnover for the last 3 years	Document fee of Rs.5000/-	Bid Security amount of Rs.2.0 lakh as per clause 1.10 of NIT	Power of Attorney on a stamp paper of Rs.100 and duly notarized authorizing to submit the proposal	In case a Joint Venture/ Association of firms, the proposal shall be accompanied by a certified copy of legally binding Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) on a stamp paper of Rs.100, signed by all firms to the joint venture/ Association as detailed at para 1.8.2	Proposal received on or before dead line of submission
1/3	M/s Balaji & Associates	Sole Proprietor	Yes	Yes	Yes (Average- Rs.0.78 Crore)	Yes	Yes (Demand Draft No-226966 dt 05-05-2020)	Yes	NA	Yes
2/3	M/s Mukesh & Associates	Sole	Yes	Yes	Yes (Average- Rs.29.73 Crore)	Yes	Yes (BG No.0903BGE20000004 dated 05.06.2020)	Yes	NA	Yes
3/3	M/s STUP Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with Stup Design Forum	Association	Yes	Yes	208.13 Cr	Yes	Yes (DD No 644489 dated 06-06-2020)	Yes	Yes	Yes

Project - Consultancy Services for Project Preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of Road Safety Advocacy Park at Kanyakumari-End Point (at Km 234/170 of NH-7) in the State of Tamil Nadu (3rd Call)

S.No	Name of Consultancy Firm/Entity (Sole Bidder/Bidder in JV)	Status of the Applicant Sole/JV/ Association	Annual turnover (Year wise) in crore			Annual Average Turnover in Last 3 years 2016-17 to 2018-19	Eligibility Status	Assesed Marks	Claimed Marks
			2016-17	2017-18	2018-19				
1/3	M/s Balaji & Associates	Sole Proprietor	0.64	0.69	1.00	0.78	Yes	0	0
2/3	M/s Mukesh & Associates	Sole	29.08	33.97	26.14	29.73	Yes	5	5
3/3	M/s STUP Consulants Pvt Ltd in association with Stup Design Forum	Association	174.4	216.7	233.3	208.13	Yes	5	5

Name of the Project			
Project - Consultancy Services for Project Preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of Road Safety Advocacy Park at Kanyakumari-End Point (at Km 234/170 of NH-7) in the State of Tamil Nadu (3rd Call)			
S.No.	Name of the Applicants	Preparation of DPR (NH/SH/Equivalent)	Annual Turnover
		The Firm should have experience of preparation of DPR/Feasibility of at least one criteria of nearly similar nature as indicated belw in last 7 years (a) Single work of Rs.80.00 lakh Or (b) Two works of Rs.50.00 lakh Or (c) Three works of Rs.40.00 lakh	Average annual turnover for last 3 years of the firm should be equal to or more than Rs.30.00 lakh
1/3	M/s Balaji & Associates	Yes	Yes
2/3	M/s Mukesh & Associates	Yes	Yes
3/3	M/s STUP Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with Stup Design Forum	Yes	Yes

Project - Consultancy Services for Project Preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of Road Safety Advocacy Park at Kanyakumari-End Point (at Km 234/170 of NH-7) in the State of Tamil Nadu (3rd Call)

M/s Balaji & Associates

Firm's relevant experience in last 7 years

The Firm should have experience of preparation of DPR/Feasibility of at least one criteria of nearly similar nature as indicated belw in last 7 years

(a) Single work of Rs.80.00 lakh Or

(b) Two works of Rs.50.00 lakh Or

(c) Three works of Rs.40.00 lakh

S.No	Client name	Project Done	Status in Past Project	Weightage for experience	Value of work (Rs.)Cr.	Date of Completion	Eligible Value of work	Page no.	Eligible Project (Y/N)
1	2	3	4	5	6	9	11	13	14
1	Build Tech on behlf of State of Kuwait	DPR	Associate	25	900	01-04-2014	225.00	11, 17-18	Y

Project - Consultancy Services for Project Preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of Road Safety Advocacy Park at Kanyakumari-End Point (at Km 234/170 of NH-7) in the State of Tamil Nadu (3rd Call)

M/s STUP Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with Stup Design Forum									
Firm's relevant experience in last 7 years									
The Firm should have experience of preparation of DPR/Feasibility of at least one criteria of nearly similar nature as indicated belw in last 7 years (a) Single work of Rs.80.00 lakh Or (b) Two works of Rs.50.00 lakh Or (c) Three works of Rs.40.00 lakh									
S.No	Client name	Project Done	Status in Past Project	Weightage for experience	Value of work (Rs.)Cr.	Date of Completion	Eligible Value of work	Page no.	Eligible Project (Y/N)
1	2	3	4	5	6	9	11	13	14
1	UPRNN Ltd	DPR	Sole	100%	640.9	10.09.2019	640.90	26	Y

Project - Consultancy Services for Project Preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of Road Safety Advocacy Park at Kanyakumari-End Point (at Km 234/170 of NH-7) in the State of Tamil Nadu (3rd Call)

M/s Mukesh & Associates

Firm's relevant experience in last 7 years

The Firm should have experience of preparation of DPR/Feasibility of at least one criteria of nearly similar nature as indicated belw in last 7 years

(a) Single work of Rs.80.00 lakh Or

(b) Two works of Rs.50.00 lakh Or

(c) Three works of Rs.40.00 lakh

S.No	Client name	Project Done	Status in Past Project	Weightage for experience	Value of work (Rs.)Cr.	Date of Completion	Eligible Value of work	Page no.	Eligible Project (Y/N)
1	2	3	4	5	6	9	11	13	14
1	Executive Engineer, Project Implementation Unit (Health Department), Gandhinagar, Govt of Gujrat	DPR	Sole	100%	145	15.11.2014	145.00	26	Y
2	Tamil Nadu Horticulture Development Agency	DPR	Sole	100%	7.45	23.03.2013	7.45	32	Y
3	Central University of Karnataka	DPR	Sole	100%	315	05.08.2019	315	40	Y
4	NIT Silchar	DPR	Sole	100%	99.8	16.06.2015	99.8	54	Y
5	NIT Odhisha	DPR	Sole	100%	72.48	28-07-2015	72.48	57	Y
6	Pondicherry University Engineering Wing	DPR	Sole	100%	60.7	Mar-14	60.7	61	Y

Project - Consultancy Services for Project Preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of Road Safety Advocacy Park at Kanyakumari-End Point (at Km 234/170 of NH-7) in the State of Tamil Nadu (3rd Call)								
Firm's relevant experience in last 7 years								
S.No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks.	1/3		2/3		3/3	
	Name of the Applicant.		M/s Balaji & Associates		M/s Mukesh & Associates		M/s STUP Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with Stup Design Forum	
	Description		Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed	Assesed	Claimed
1	Specific experience of the DPR consultancy related to the assignment for eligibility	20	0				0	
1.1	Project of DPR / Feasibility study of nearly similar in nature							
1.1.1	More than one Project of DPR / Feasibility study of nearly similar in nature	10						
1.1.2	More than two Project of DPR / Feasibility study of nearly similar in nature	15						
1.1.3	More than three Project of DPR / Feasibility study of nearly similar in nature	20		20	20	20		20
2	Specific experience of firms in terms of turnover	5	0	0				
2.1	Firm's Average Turnover of last 3years > 5 crore	5			5	5	5	5
2.2	Firm Average Turnover of last 3 years, 2-4 crore	4						
2.3	Firm Average Turnover of last 3 years, 1-2 crore	3						
	Total	25	0	20	25	25	5	25

0
#VALUE!

2. 2. Adequacy of the proposed work plan and methodology in responding to the TOR

Project - Consultancy Services for Project Preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of Road Safety Advocacy Park at Kanyakumari-End Point (at Km 234/170 of NH-7) in the State of Tamil Nadu (3rd Call)

S.No.	Description	Max Marks	1/3			2/3			3/3		
			M/s Balaji & Associates			M/s Mukesh & Associates			M/s STUP Consultants Pvt Ltd		
			Ref: Pg no	Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed	Ref: Pg no	Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed	Ref: Pg no	Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed
1	Site Appreciation	1	Pg-147	1	1	Pg-8	1	1	178	1	1
2	Team composition and task assignment	1	Pg-157	1	1	Pg-11	1	1	182	1	1
3	Methodology*	3	Pg-162		3				186		
3.1	Approach and initial view on project plan including key challenges envisaged and potential solutions for										
3.1.1	Proposed concept plan	1		1		15-27	1	1		1	1
3.1.2	Access control	1		1			1	1		1	1
3.2	Adoption of superior technology along with proof of past use vendor association	1		1			1	1		1	1
	TOTAL	5		5	5		5	5		5	5

Project - Consultancy Services for Project Preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of Road Safety Advocacy Park at Kanyakumari-End Point (at Km 234/170 of NH-7) in the State of Tamil Nadu (3rd Call)

Material testing, Survey and investigation equipment and software proposed to be used

	Description	Max Points	1/3			2/3			3/3		
			M/s Balaji & Associates			M/s Mukesh & Associates			M/s STUP Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with Stup Design Forum		
			Ref:	Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed	Ref:	Marks Assessed	Marks Claimed	Ref	Marks Assessed	Marks claimed
1	Availability of in-house material testing facility	3									
1.1	Available	3				Pg-30	3	3	200	3	3
1.2(a)	outsourced Through NABL accredited labs / IIT / NIT labs	2	Pg-169	2	2						
(b)	Other than (a)	1									
2	Field investigation facilities	2									
2.1	Available (Created in-house at site)	2				Pg-38	2	2	201	2	2
2.2(a)	outsourced Through NABL accredited labs / IIT / NIT labs	1	Pg-189	1	1						
(b)	Other than (a)	0									
3	Office Equipment and software	3									
3.1	High level (More than 75% as per ToR requirement)	3	203-205	3	3	33-35, 39-40 & 67-69	3	3	202	3	3
3.2	Medium Level (Between 75%-50% as per ToR requirement)	2									
3.3	Low Level (Less than 50% as per ToR requirement)	1									
4	Experience in using GPR and Induction Loactor or better technology for detection of sub-surface utilitites (Infrastructure Sector)	4		0						0	4
4.1	1-2 project	1				051 & 065	1	4			
4.2	3-5 projects	2									
4.3	>5 projects	4			4						
5	Experience in digitization of cadastral maps for land surveys	8		0					Page No 138	8	8
5.1	Project of area upto 5 ha	2									
5.2	Project of area between 5-10 ha	5									
5.3	Project of area more than 10 ha	8			8	Pg-60	8	8			
	Total	20		6	18		17	20		16	20

Project - Consultancy Services for Project Preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of Road Safety Advocacy Park at Kanyakumari-End Point (at Km 234/170 of NH-7) in the State of Tamil Nadu (3rd Call)

TEAM LEADER

S.No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks.	1/3			2/3			3/3		
	Name of the Applicant.		M/s Balaji & Associates			M/s Mukesh & Associates			M/s STUP Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with Stup Design Forum		
	Name of the Key Personnel		Balaji			M.Chandirasekaran			N.J.Wesley		
	DoB.		15.07.1966			21.05.1971			02.06.1965		
	Description		Assesed	Claimed	Remark	Assesed	Claimed	Remark	Assessed	Claimed	Remarks
I	General Qualification	25									
i)	Degree in Civil Engineering or equivalent	20	20	20		20	20		20	20	
ii)	Post Graduation in Highway Engg./Structures/Traffic and Transportation/Soil Mechanics and Foundation Engineering/ Construction Management/Transportation	5	5	5		0	0		5	5	
II	Relevant Experience & Adequacy for the Project	70									
a)	Total Professional Experience	15	15	15		13	13	20 years 4 months	15	15	
	<15 years	0									
	15-18 years	11									
	18-21 years	13									
	>21 years	15									
b)	Experience in Similar Projects - Experience in Planning, project preparation and design of nearly similar Projects	25	0	25	7 years	18	25	12 Years 2 Months	18	25	14 years 10 months for project 4,16-19,22-25,36&46
	<12 years	0									
	12-15 years	18									
	15 -18 years	22									
	>18 years	25									
c)	Experience in Similar Capacity	30	30	30	Project No 5,6,8,9,10&11	30	30	Pr No 9 - 18	0	30	only 1 project at S.N36
	Experience in Similar projects as Team Leader or equivalent - Experience in Planning, project preparation and design of nearly similar Projects										
	< 2 projects	0									
	2 projects	10									
	3-5 projects	20									
III	Employment with Firm	5	5	5		5	5		5	5	
	Less than 1 Year	0									
	1-2 years	2.5									
	more than 2 years	5									
	Total	100	75	100		86	93		63	100	
	Weightage	10	7.5	10		8.6	9.3		6.3	10	

Project - Consultancy Services for Project Preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of Road Safety Advocacy Park at Kanyakumari-End Point (at Km 234/170 of NH-7) in the State of Tamil Nadu (3rd Call)								
Architect								
S.No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks.	1/3			2/3		
	Name of the Applicant.		M/s Balaji & Associates			M/s Mukesh & Associates		
	Name of the Key Personnel		Premkumar			R.Maheshwaran		
	DoB.		18.06.1957			17.6.1982		
	Description		Assesed	Remark	Claimed	Assesed	Remarks	Claimed
I	General Qualification	25						
i)	Degree in Architecture or equivalent	20	20		20	20		20
ii)	Post graduation in Highway Engg/ Transportation Engineering/ Architecture [AICTE	5						
II	Relevant Experience & Adequacy for the Project	70						
a)	Total Professional Experience	15	15			15		15
	<8 years	0						
	8-12 years	11						
	12-15 years	13						
	>15 years	15						
b)	Experience as Architect	25	25	> 15 years	25	22	13 years 5 months	25
	<6 years	0						
	6-10 years	18						
	10-15 years	22						
	>15 years	25						
c)	Experience in Similar Capacity	30						
(i)	Experience as Architect in nearly similar nature of work - Number of projects		20	Project No 3,8,9,10&11		30	Project No 4-16	30
	2 projects	10						
	3- 5 projects	20						
	More than 5 projects	30						
III	Employment with Firm	5	5			5		5
	Less than 1 Year	0						
	1-2 years	2.5						
	more than 2 years	5						
	Total	100	85		95	92		95
	Weightage	9	7.65		8.55	8.28		8.55

Project - Consultancy Services for Project Preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of Road Safety Advocacy Park at Kanyakumari-End Point (at Km 234/170 of NH-7) in the State of Tamil Nadu (3rd Call)

Structural Engineer

S.No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks.	1/3			2/3		
	Name of the Applicant.		M/s Balaji & Associates			M/s Mukesh & Associates		
	Name of the Key Personnel		Janarthanan			Narmadha		
	DoB.		01.01.1968			31.05.1983		
	Description		Assesed	Remark	Claimed	Assesed	Remark	Claimed
I	General Qualification	25						
i)	Degree in Civil Engineering or equivalent	20	20		20	20		20
ii)	Post Graduation in Structural Engineering/ Bridge Engineering	5	5		5	5		5
II)	Relevant Experience & Adequacy for the Project	70						
a)	Total Professional Experience	15	15		15	13	Pr at Sr.No.1 to 10	13
	<10 years	0						
	10-12 years	11						
	12 -15 years	13						
	> 15 years	15						
b)	Experience in nearly similar projects	20	0	3 years 3 Months	20	17	10 Years 11 Months (Pr at Sr.No.3 to 10)	17
i)	Experience as structural engineer							
	<8 years	0						
	8-10 years	14						
	10-12 years	17						
	>12 years	20						
ii)	Experience as structural enginner in nearly similar projects	35	25	Project No 4,5&6	35	35	Pr at Sr.No.3 to 10	35
	2 Projects	15						
	2-4 Projects	25						
	>4 projects	35						
III	Employment with Firm	5	5		5	5		5
	Less than 1 Year	0						
	1-2 years	2.5						
	more than 2 years	5						
	Total	100	70		100	95		95
	Weightage	4	2.8		4	3.8		3.8

Project - Consultancy Services for Project Preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of Road Safety Advocacy Park at Kanyakumari-End Point (at Km 234/170 of NH-7) in the State of Tamil Nadu (3rd Call)

Material Engineer cum Geotechnical Engineer cum Geologist

S.No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks.	1/3			2/3		
	Name of the Applicant.		M/s Balaji & Associates			M/s Mukesh & Associates		
	Name of the Key Personnel		Sethuraman			P.Sivaguru		
	DoB.		19.07.1968			05.05.1957		
	Description		Assesed	Remarks	Claimed	Assesed	Remarks	Claimed
I	General Qualification	25						
i)	Degree in Civil Engineering/ M.Sc in Geology	20	20		20	20		20
ii)	Post graduation in Founation Engineering/Soil Mechanics/Geo Tech Engineering	5	5		5	5		5
II)	Relevant Experience & Adequacy for the Project	70						
a)	Total Professional Experience	15	15		15	15		15
	< 10 years	0						
	10-12 years	11						
	12-15 years	13						
	>15 years	15						
b)	Experience as Material cum Geo-Technical Engineer	25	25		25	18	8 years 6 months (Pr at S.N.13 to 24)	18
	<7 years	0						
	7-10 years	18						
	10-12 years	22						
	>12 years	25						
c)	Experience as Material cum Geo-Technical Engineer in nearly similar projects	30	20	Pr No 5,6,7	30	30	Pr at S.N.9,21-24	30
	2 projects	10						
	2-4 projects	20						
	> 4 projects	30						
III	Employment with Firm	5	5		5	5		5
	Less than 1 Year	0						
	1-2 years	2.5						
	more than 2 years	5						
	Total	100	90		100	93		93
	Weightage	4	3.6		4	3.72		3.72

Project - Consultancy Services for Project Preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of Road Safety Advocacy Park at Kanyakumari-End Point (at Km 234/170 of NH-7) in the State of Tamil Nadu (3rd Call)								
Senior Survey Engineer								
S.No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks.	1/3			2/3		
	Name of the Applicant.		M/s Balaji & Associates			M/s Mukesh & Associates		
	Name of the Key Personnel		Pandy			Selvaraj		
	DoB.		26.01.1974			16.06.1972		
	Description		Assesed	Remark	Claimed	Assesed	Remarks	Claimed
I	General Qualification	25						
i)	Degree or Equivalent in Civil Engineering/Diploma in Civil Engineering/Diploma in Surveying	20	20		20	20		20
ii)	Post graduation in Survey Engineering/Surveying/Remote Sensing	5	0	Masters in Structural Engg	5	0		0
II)	Relevant Experience & Adequacy for the Project	70						
a)	Total Professional Experience	15	15		15	15		15
	< 10 years	0						
	10-12 years	11						
	12-15 years	13						
	>15 years	15						
b)	Experience as Survey Engineer	20	20		20	20	13 Years 6 Months (Pr at S.N 7 to 17)	20
(i)	<8 years	0						
	8-10 years	14						
	10-12 years	17						
	>12 years	20						
(ii)	Knowledge and understanding of modern computer based method of surveying	5	5		5	5		5
	Yes	5						
	No	0						
c)	Experience as Survey Engineer in nearly similar projects	30	30	3,4,5,6,7&9	30	30	Pr at S.N 13 to 17	30
	2 projects	10						
	2-4 projects	20						
	> 4 projects	30						
III	Employment with Firm	5	5		5	5		5
	Less than 1 Year	0						
	1-2 years	2.5						
	more than 2 years	5						
	Total	100	95		100	95		95
	Weightage	6	5.7		6	5.7		5.7

Project - Consultancy Services for Project Preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of Road Safety Advocacy Park at Kanyakumari-End Point (at Km 234/170 of NH-7) in the State of Tamil Nadu (3rd Call)

Environmental Specialist

S.No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks.	1/3			2/3		
	Name of the Applicant.		M/s Balaji & Associates			M/s Mukesh & Associates		
	Name of the Key Personnel		Baskaran			Prabhu		
	DoB.		09.06.1968			19.05.1987		
	Description		Assesed	Remark	Claimed	Assesed	Remark	Claimed
I	General Qualification	25						
i)	Degree in Civil Engineering/ Environmental Engineering or Post Gradutaion in Environmentl Sciences	20	20		20	20		20
ii)	Post graduation in Environmental Engineering	5	5		5	5		5
II)	Relevant Experience & Adequacy for the Project	70						
a)	Total Professional Experience	15	11	7 years 6 months	15	13		13
	< 6 years	0						
	6-8 years	11						
	8-10 years	13						
	>10 years	15						
b)	Experience as Environmental Specialist	25	22	7 years 6 months	25	22		22
	<5 years	0						
	5-7 years	18						
	7-10 years	22						
	>10 years	25						
c)	Experience as Environmental Specialist in similar projects	30	20	1,4,5&6	30	30	Pr at S.N 5-9	30
	2 projects	10						
	2-4 projects	20						
	> 4 projects	30						
III	Employment with Firm	5	5		5	5		5
	Less than 1 Year	0						
	1-2 years	2.5						
	more than 2 years	5						
	Total	100	83		100	95		95
	Weightage	4	3.32		4	3.8		3.8

Project - Consultancy Services for Project Preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of Road Safety Advocacy Park at Kanyakumari-End Point (at Km 234/170 of NH-7) in the State of Tamil Nadu (3rd Call)								
Quantity Surveyor/Documentation Expert								
S.No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks.	1/3			2/3		
	Name of the Applicant.		M/s Balaji & Associates			M/s Mukesh & Associates		
	Name of the Key Personnel		Tuffy G Thomas			Nithya		
	DoB.		30.07.1980			09.12.1982		
	Description		Assesed	Remark	Claimed	Assesed	Remark	Claimed
I	General Qualification	25						
i)	Graduate or equivalent in Civil Engineering/ Certificate course from Institution of Quantity Surveying	20	20		20	20		20
ii)	Graduate or equivalent in Civil Engineering	5	0		5	5		5
II)	Relevant Experience & Adequacy for the Project	70						
a)	Total Professional Experience	15	15		15	13		13
	< 10 years	0						
	10-12 years	11						
	12-15 years	13						
	>15 years	15						
b)	Experience in preparation of Bill of Quantities, Contrcat docments and documentation	25	0	7 years 4 months	18	25	13 yr 1 month(Project at S.N 1to 10	25
	<8 years	0						
	8-10 years	18						
	10-12 years	22						
	>12 years	25						
c)	Experience as Quantity Surveyor in neary similar projects	30	20	Pr No 3-6	30	30	Poject at S.N 6 - 10	30
	2 projects	10						
	2-4 projects	20						
	> 4 projects	30						
III	Employment with Firm	5	5		5	5		5
	Less than 1 Year	0						
	1-2 years	2.5						
	more than 2 years	5						
	Total	100	60		93	98		98
	Weightage	7	4.2		6.51	6.86		6.86

Project - Consultancy Services for Project Preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of Road Safety Advocacy Park at Kanyakumari-End Point (at Km 234/170 of NH-7) in the State of Tamil Nadu (3rd Call)								
Electrical Engineer cum Safety Expert								
S.No.	Applicant No.	Max Marks.	1/3			2/3		
	Name of the Applicant.		M/s Balaji & Associates			M/s Mukesh & Associates		
	Name of the Key Personnel		Kubendran			Rajendran		
	DoB.		18.06.1964			30.05.1979		
	Description		Assesed	Remark	Claimed	Assesed	Remark	Claimed
I	General Qualification	25						
i)	Graduate or equivalent in Electrical Engineering	20	20		20	20		20
ii)	Diploma in Safety Engineering	5	0		0	0		0
II)	Relevant Experience & Adequacy for the Project	70						
a)	Total Professional Experience	15	15		15	15	Pr at S.N1-12	15
	< 10 years	0						
	10-12 years	11						
	12-15 years	13						
	>15 years	15						
b)	Experience as Electrical Engineer	15	15		15	15	Pr at S.N1-12	15
	<8 years	0						
	8-10 years	8						
	10-12 years	12						
	>12 years	15						
c)	Experience as Safety Expert	10	8	8 Years 6 Months	10	10	Pr at S.N2-12	10
	<2 years	0						
	2-5 years	5						
	5-10 years	8						
	>10 years	10						
d)	Experience as Electrical Engineer in nearly similar projects	15	10	Project at S.n 6,8,9&10	15	15	Pr at S.N8-12	15
	2 projects	5						
	2-4 projects	10						
	> 4 projects	15						
	e)	Experience as Safety Expert in nearly similar projects						10
2 projects		5						
2-4 projects		8						
> 4 projects		10						
f)		Knowledge understanding or preparation of electrical layouts	2.5	2.5		2.5	2.5	
	Yes	2.5						
	No	0						
g)	Knowledge understanding or preparation of Safety Expert	2.5	2.5		2.5	2.5	2.5	
	Yes	2.5						
	No	0						
III	Employment with Firm	5	5		5	5		5
	Less than 1 Year	0						
	1-2 years	2.5						
	more than 2 years	5						
	Total	100	86		95	95		95
	Weightage	6	5.16		5.7	5.7		5.7

Summary of CV

Project - Consultancy Services for Project Preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of Road Safety Advocacy Park at Kanyakumari-End Point (at Km 234/170 of NH-7) in the State of Tamil Nadu (3rd Call)

S.No	Applicant No.	Max Marks	1/3					2/3					3/3				
	Name of Applicant		M/s Balaji & Associates					M/s Mukesh & Associates					M/s STUP Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with Stup Design Forum				
	Key Position		Name of the Key Staff	Assesed	Assesed weightage	Claimed Marks	Claimed weightage	Name of the Key Staff	Assesed	Assesed weightage	Claimed Marks	Claimed weightage	Name of the Key Staff	Assesed	Assesed weightage	Claimed Marks	Claimed weightage
1	Team Leader	10	Balaji	75	7.5	100	10	M.Chandirasekaran	86	8.6	93	9.3	N.J.Wesley	63	6.3		
2	Architect	9	Premkumar	85	7.65	95	8.55	R.Maheshwaran	92	8.28	95	8.55	No Responsive as per Clause 3.2.4 (ii) & 5.2 of LOI as score (63) of Team Leader is less than 75				
3	Structural Engineer	4	Janarthanan	70	2.8	100	4	Narmadha	95	3.8	95	3.8					
4	Material Engineer cum Geotechnical Engineer cum Geologist	4	Sethuraman	90	3.6	100	4	P.Sivaguru	93	3.72	93	3.72					
5	Senior Survey Engineer	6	Pandy	95	5.7	100	6	Selvaraj	95	5.7	95	5.7					
6	Environmental Specialist	4	Baskaran	83	3.32	100	4	Prabhu	95	3.8	95	3.8					
7	Quantity Surveyor/Documentation expert	7	Tuffy G Thomas	60	4.2	93	6.51	Nithya	98	6.86	98	6.86					
8	Electrical Engineer cum Safety Expert	6	Kubendran	86	5.16	95	5.7	Rajendran	95	5.7	95	5.7					
Total		50			39.93		48.76			46.46		47.43					

Name of the Project

Project - Consultancy Services for Project Preparation of Feasibility Study/ Detailed Project Report of Road Safety Advocacy Park at Kanyakumari-End Point (at Km 234/170 of NH-7) in the State of Tamil Nadu (3rd Call)

Final Summary sheet

S. No.	Name of Bidder	Relevant Experience for the assignment*		Adequacy of approach and methodology		Material testing, survey & investigation, equipment and software proposed to be used		Qualifications and competence of the key staff for the assignment		Total		Rank of the Firm	Status of the Applicant
	Maximum Marks	25		5		20		50		100			
Assessed		Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed	Assessed	Claimed			
1/3	M/s Balaji & Associates	0.00	20.00	5.00	5.00	6.00	18.00	39.93	48.76	50.93	91.76	Non-Responsive as per Clause 5.2 of LOI as the Technical Score is less than 75	
2/3	M/s Mukesh & Associates	25.00	25.00	5.00	5.00	17.00	20.00	46.46	47.43	93.46	97.43	1	Responsive
3/3	M/s STUP Consultants Pvt Ltd in association with Stup Design Forum	No Responsive as per Clause 3.2.4 (ii) & 5.2 of LOI as score (63) of Team Leader is less than 75											

Signature Not Verified

Digitally signed by RAKESH KUMAR SINGH
Date: 2020.07.10 18:00:07 IST
Location: eProcurement System for Central PSUs

