

NHAI/F&A/IA/45/2016-17/HQ

Tender No – 2020_NHAI_39870_1

Result of Technical Evaluation.

Sl No	Name of the bidder	Result	Remarks
1	M/s B M Chatrath & Co	Non responsive	a) The CA firm has submitted the certificate of incorporation of the firm as on 01.09.1955 issued by the ICAI. As per ICAI Certificate (i) there is only one partner in the firm against minimum eligibility requirement of 10 partners; and (ii) No full time CA employed (however proposal contains details of 3 CAs against minimum requirement of 10 CAs [Refer RFP clause 2.1.12 & 2.4.1]. As per Cl 2.4.1 (i), the CA firm has to submit the certificate showing status of the firm as on 01.01.2020 or any date thereafter. b) List of 128 Cos audited contains 45 Companies names twice (no.) resulting 83 companies audited against minimum eligibility requirement of 100 companies [Refer RFP clause 2.1.12 & 2.4.1] c) Information against RFP clause 2.4.1 (8) not provided in the prescribed format and audited only 4 entities against the minimum eligibility requirement of 5 entities (Refer RFP Clause 2.1.12 & 2.4.1)
2	M/s J Singh & Associates	Non responsive	a) Not submitted Annexure III (Undertaking - conflict of Interest)- [Refer Clause 2.1.12 & 2.4.1] b) Not conducted audit of at least 100 companies in the capacity of Statutory/ Internal Auditor. The firm has provided a list of 70 companies only against the minimum eligibility requirement of 100 companies (RFP clause 2.4.1) c) Delhi/NCR office of the firm with number of partners

			stationed in Deli/NCR as per Partnership Deed does not tally with ICAI certificate. (As per ICAI certificate Mr. Devendar Tyagi is not a partner)
3	M/s Suresh Surana & Associated LLP	Non-responsive	a) As per ICAI Certificate bidder is not meeting the criteria of minimum experience of 20 years, however, Bidder claimed 35 years experience in its proposal. All the partners have joined the firm on or after 19.12.2001 [Refer RFP clause 2.1.12 & 2.4.1].
4	M/s Pipara & Co, LLP	Responsive	
5	SARC & Associates	Non-responsive	a) Bidder is not meeting the criteria for conducting audit of at least 5 PSUs/100 companies in the capacity of Statutory/ Internal Auditor. [Refer RFP Cl. 2.4.1(7)]; (b) Not Conducting audit of atleast 5 entities having PPP/BOT/EPC Projects (Refer Cl.2.4.1 (8)) c) As per ICAI Certificate bidder firm has 8 qualified full time CAs against minimum eligibility requirement of 10 CAs [Refer Cl. 2.1.2 & 2.4.1] -However, bidder vide its declaration/ confirmation dated 29.01.2020 (page No. 20) mentioned 10 qualified CAs in full time employment.
6	M/s T R Chadha & Associates LLP.	Responsive	
7	M/s Nangia & Co, LLP	Non-responsive	a) Turnover of the Bidder is less than Rs. 10 crores. b) Bidder firm has only 6 partners c) ICAI Certificate dated 25.03.2019 submitted by Bidder. [Refer Clause 2.1.12 & 2.4.12)

The bidders can submit their objections/clarifications, if any, by 29.04.2020 upto 6.00 PM through e mail only at bmrao@nhai.org or akgoyal@nhai.org.