

TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT

Sub: Consultancy Services as Independent Engineer during Operation & Maintenance of 4- laned divided carriageway from Km 22.300 (Thondupally) to Km 211 (Kurnool) of Package Nos. NS-2/BOT/AP-3, AP-4 & AP-5 on Hyderabad - Bangalore Section of NH-44 (Old NH-7) in the State of Telangana & Andhra Pradesh on BOT (Toll/Annuity) basis under North -South Corridor (NHDP Phase-II) -**reg.**

The Technical Proposals of all the firms who submitted their bids by bid due date i.e. 04.02.2020 for the subject Consultancy work have been evaluated and detailed evaluation sheets are enclosed.

2. Results of technical evaluation is being made available on the website giving an opportunity to all the bidders to respond within 07 days i.e. on or before 10.06.2020 (upto 1730 Hrs.), in case they have any objection.

MINIMUM ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA					
Consultancy Services as Independent Engineer during Operation & Maintenance of 4- laned divided carriageway from Km 22.300 (Thondupally) to Km 211 (Kurnool) of Package Nos. NS-2/BOT/AP-3, AP-4 & AP-5 on Hyderabad – Bangalore Section of NH-44 (Old NH-7) in the State of Telangana & Andhra Pradesh on BOT (Toll/Annuitiy) basis under North –South Corridor (NHDP Phase-II)					
S.No.	Firm	Experience of the firm in last 7 years		Annual Turnover	Eligible/ Not Eligible
		Preparation of DPR (NH/SH/Equivalent)	Project Supervision/IC (NH/SH/Equivalent)		
		The firm should have prepared DPR/IFS cum PPR for at least two projects of 4/6 laning** of 30% of project length each or one project of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning** of 50% of project length.	At least two construction projects of four/six laning** of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning** of 50% of project length.	Annual turnover (average of last 5 years or in each of the preceding two years) of the firm from consultancy business should be equal to or more than Rs.2.5 Crore.	
1	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd.,	✓	✓	✓	Eligible
2	M/s L.N. Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd	✓	✓	✓	Eligible
3	M/s Anvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association with M/s Shree Bhawani Consultancy Service Pvt. Ltd.	✓	✓	✓	Eligible
4	TPF Getinsa Eurostudios S.L. in Association with Segmental Consulting & Infrastructure Advisory Pvt. Ltd.	✓	✓	✓	Eligible
5	M/s Wadia Techno Engineering Services Limited in Associates with M/s Transwat Engineering Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. with M/s Indian Road Survey and Management Pvt. Ltd.	✓	X	X	Non-Eligible
6	M/s MSV International Inc. in Association with M/s MSV International Tech Pvt. Ltd.	✓	✓	✓	Eligible

FINAL RESULT (SUMMARY OF TECHNICAL EVALUATION)

Consultancy Services as Independent Engineer during Operation & Maintenance of 4- laned divided carriageway from Km 22.300 (Thondupally) to Km 211 (Kurnool) of Package Nos. NS-2/BOT/AP-3, AP-4 & AP-5 on Hyderabad – Bangalore Section of NH-44 (Old NH-7) in the State of Telangana & Andhra Pradesh on BOT (Toll/Annuity) basis under North –South Corridor (NHDP Phase-II)									
S. No.	Details	Max. Marks	1	2	3	4	5	6	
			M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd.,	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd	M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association with M/s Shree Bhawani Consultancy Service Pvt. Ltd.	TPF Getinsa Euroestudios S.L. in Association with Segmental Consulting & Infrastructure Advisory Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Wadia Techno Engineering Services Limited in Transwat Engineering Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. with M/s Indian Road Survey and Management Pvt. Ltd.	M/s MSV international Inc. in Association with M/s MSV International Tech Pvt. Ltd.	
1	Firm Experience	35	30.750	30.000	34.000	32.000	10.500	31.750	
2	Experience in use of technology	20	15.000	20.000	20.000	18.000	0.000	19.000	
3	Methodology	5	5.000	4.000	5.000	5.000	5.000	5.000	
4	Team Leader cum Highway Engineer	19	17.100	17.195	18.05	17.100	10.450	17.29	
5	Highway maintenance cum Resident Engineer I	4	3.540	3.640	3.4292	3.640	3.626	3.64	
6	Highway maintenance cum Resident Engineer II	4	3.640	3.640	3.64	3.640	3.640	3.6932	
7	Highway maintenance cum Resident Engineer III	4	3.640	3.640	3.1732	3.800	3.640	3.64	
8	Bridge/Structural Engineer	4	3.640	3.960	4	3.640	3.786	3.732	
9	Road Safety Expert	5	4.725	4.750	4.52	4.750	4.440	4.75	
	Total	100	87.035	90.825	95.812	91.570	45.083	92.495	

Assessment of Experience of the Firm										
Consultancy Services as Independent Engineer during Operation & Maintenance of 4- laned divided carriageway from Km 22.300 (Thondupally) to Km 211 (Kurnool) of Package Nos. NS-2/BOT/AP-3, AP-4 & AP-5 on Hyderabad – Bangalore Section of NH-44 (Old NH-7) in the State of Telangana & Andhra Pradesh on BOT (Toll/Annuity) basis under North –South Corridor (NHDP Phase-II)										
S.No.	Description	Maximum Marks	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd.,	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd	M/s Anvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association with M/s Shree Bhawan Consultancy Service Pvt. Ltd.	TPF Gelinsa Eurostudios S.L. in Association with Segmental Consulting & Infrastructure Advisory Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Wadia Techno Engineering Services Limited in Associates with M/s Transwat Engineering Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. with M/s Indian Road Survey and Management Pvt. Ltd.	M/s MSV International Inc. in Association with M/s MSV International Tech Pvt. Ltd.	Marks	Marks
1	Year of Establishment of the Firm (In case of JV year of establishment of Lead Member shall be considered) (Min 5 years) For 5 years - 1.5 marks More than 5 years - 2 marks	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
2	Average Annual Turnover (last 5 years or in each of the preceding two years) from consultancy business (Min 5 Crore) For >50 Crores - 2 marks For 20-50 Crores- 1.5 marks For 10-20 Crores- 1 mark For 5-10 Crores- 0.5 mark	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
3	Numbers of key personnel with the firm more than one year with the firm. < 4 personnel - 0 marks 4 to 12 - Linearly varying from 0.25 to 2 > 12 personnel - 2 marks	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
4	Experience in DPR/Feasibility cum PPR preparation for two projects of 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each or one project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length in last 7 years 2 project 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each - 4 marks Or 1 project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length - 4 marks Add 0.25 (Zero point two five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 1 marks.	5	4.75	4	5	4	4.5	4.25		
5	In hand DPRs for NHAI Projects For DPR project length > the length of project for which RFP invited -5 Marks For DPR project length > two times the length of project for which RFP invited -7.5 Marks For project length > three times the length of project for which RFP invited - 10 Marks	10	7.5	7.5	10	10	0	10		
6	Experience as Independent Engineer/Authority Engineer/ Supervision Consultant two construction projects of four/six laning ** of 30% of project length each or one projects of four/six laning ** of 50% project length in last 7 years. 2 construction projects 4/6 laning of 30% of project length each -4marks Or 1 construction project of 4/6 laning of 50% of project length - 4 marks Add 1(one) mark extra for completed assignment of Independent Engineer and add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for completed assignment of supervision consultancy subject to maximum 2 (two) mark.	6	6	6	6	6	0	5		
7	Experience as Independent Engineer/Supervision Consultants one O&M project under DBFOT/OMT/O&M of four/six laning** of 50% of project length in last 7 years 1 project - 6 marks Add 0.5 (Zero point five) marks extra for each additional project subject to maximum 2 marks.	8	6.5	6.5	7	6	0	6.5		
	Total	35	30.75	30	34	32	10.5	31.75		

Experience in use of Technology									
Consultancy Services as Independent Engineer during Operation & Maintenance of 4- laned divided carriageway from Km 22.300 (Thondupally) to Km 211 (Kurmoil) of Package Nos. NS-2/BOT/AP-3, AP-4 & AP-5 on Hyderabad – Bangalore Section of NH-44 (Old NH-7) in the State of Telangana & Andhra Pradesh on BOT (Toll/Annuity) basis under North –South Corridor (NHDP Phase-II)									
S.No.	Description	Maximum Marks	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd.,	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd	M/s Aarvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association with M/s Shree Bhawani Consultancy Service Pvt. Ltd.	TPF Geinsa Eurostudios S.L. in Association with Segmental Consulting & Infrastructure Advisory Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Wadia Techno Engineering Services Limited in Associates with M/s Transwat Engineering Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. with M/s Indian Road Survey and Management Pvt. Ltd.	M/s MSV International Inc. in Association with M/s MSV International Tech Pvt. Ltd.	
1	Experience in Network Survey Vehicle (NSV) or better technology for pavement inspection Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis - 1 Own Equipment - 2 1-2 projects - 1 3-5 projects - 2 > 5 projects - 3	5	5	5	5	5	0	4	
2	Experience in Falling Weight Deflectometer (FWD) or better technology for pavement strength measurement Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis - 1 Own Equipment - 2 1-3 projects - 1 > 3 projects - 2	4	2	4	4	4	0	4	
3	Experience in Mobile Bridge Inspection Unit (MBIU) or better technology for bridges inspection with Associate or on hiring basis - 1 Equipment - 2 1-3 projects - 1 > 3 projects - 2	4	3	4	4	2	0	4	
4	Experience in Retro reflectometer technology Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis - 1 Own Equipment - 2 1-3 projects - 1 > 3 projects - 2	4	3	4	4	4	0	4	
	Experience in Automatic Traffic Counter cum Classifier (ATCO) Equipment on MOU with Associate or on hiring basis - 1 Own Equipment - 2 1-3 projects - 0.5 > 3 projects - 1	3	2	3	3	3	0	3	
Total		20	15	20	20	18	0	19	

Work plan and Methodology									
Consultancy Services as Independent Engineer during Operation & Maintenance of 4-laned divided carriageway from Km 22.300 (Thondupally) to Km 211 (Kurnool) of Package Nos. NS-2/BOT/AP-3, AP-4 & AP-5 on Hyderabad – Bangalore Section of NH-44 (Old NH-7) in the State of Telangana & Andhra Pradesh on BOT (Toll/Annuity) basis under North –South Corridor (NHDP Phase-II)									
S.No.	Description	Maximum Marks	M/s Theme Engineering Services Pvt. Ltd.,	M/s L N Malviya Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd	M/s Aanvee Associates Architects Engineers & Consultants Pvt. Ltd. in Association with M/s Shree Bhawan Consultancy Service Pvt. Ltd.	TPF Getinsa Eurostudios S.L. in Association with Segmental Consulting & Infrastructure Advisory Pvt. Ltd.	M/s Wadia Techno Engineering Services Limited in Associates with M/s Transwat Engineering Consultancy Pvt. Ltd. with M/s Indian Road Survey and Management Pvt. Ltd.	M/s MSV international Inc. in Association with M/s MSV International Tech Pvt. Ltd.	Marks
1	Site Appreciation (i) Average 0.50 (ii) Good 0.75 (iii) Very Good 1.00	1	1	0	1	1	1		1
2	Quality of Approach and Methodology (Review of scope of work and design review, construction supervision methodology, contract management approach, safety review/audit and O&M stage, initial view on project plan including key challenges envisaged and potential solutions to be judged). (i) Average 0.75 (ii) Good 1.50 (iii) Very Good 2.00	2	2	2	2	2	2		2
3	Quality Audit Methodology and Quality Assurance Plan (i) Average 0.75 (ii) Good 1.50 (iii) Very Good 2.00	2	2	2	2	2	2		2
	Total	5	5	4	5	5	5		5

Evaluation Sheet -Team Leader

S. N.	Description	Max. Marks	Theme	L N Malviya	Aarvee	TPF	Wadia	MSV
1	General Qualification/Name/DOB	25	Manoj Kumar	Ajay L Pal	Mohammad Gouse Basha	B. Hemantha Rao	Katukooru Raji Reddy	Ashok Kumar Mishra
	i. Graduate in Civil Engineering -21marks		21	21	21	21	21	21
	ii. Post Graduation in Management/ Construction/ Transportation/ Highway Engineering/ Structural Engineering/ any other specialized stream of civil engineering . - 04 marks.	25	0	0	4	0	4	0
2	Adequacy for the project	70						
Professional Experience in Highway Projects:								
i)	Total Highway Professional Experience							
	< 10 years -0							
	10 years -22	30	30	30	30	30	30	30
	Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.							
ii)	Experience as Team leader/Project Manager or in Similar Capacity* in O&M of completed 4/6 lane highway sections							
	< 3 years -0	35	35	32.5	30	35	0	35
	3 years -30							
	Add 2.5 marks extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 5 (five) marks.							
iii)	Experience in similar capacity* in Highway Development Projects taken up under PPP							
	1 projects - 4 marks	5	4	4	5	4	0	5
	add 1 mark extra for additional projects subject to maximum 1 (one) marks							
	Employment with the Firm							
3	< 1 year -0							
	1 year -3	5	0	3	5	0	0	0
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks							
	Total	100	90	90.5	95	90	55	91

Evaluation Sheet - Highway Maintenance cum Resident Engineer I

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	Theme	L N Malviya	Aarvee	TPF	Wadia	MSV
	General Qualification/Name/DOB	25	Rajarao Macharla 06-06-1973	Mallikarjun 01-01-1961	Amul V. Kotharkar 24-03-1980	KALHOLE CHANDRA MOULI 01-07-1967	MAHABOO B BASHA 01-06-1975	A CHANDRA SHEKAR 23-08-1977
2	i. Graduate in Civil Engineering- 21 marks ii. Post Graduation in Highway Engg.- 04 marks Adequacy for the project	25 70	21	21	25	21	21	21
Professional Experience								
i)	Experience in Highway works (inspection/design/construction/maintenance)							
	< 7 years -0							
	7years -22 Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.	30	30	30	30	30	30	30
ii)	Experience in similar capacity* in highway Construction / Maintenance works of similar nature< 3 years -0							
	3 years -12 Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.	15	15	15	9.73	15	14.66	15
	Experience in similar capacity* in project involving Construction/ Maintenance works of 4/6 laning/ Expressways 1 project -20 Add 2.5 marks extra for each project to maximum 5 (five) marks.	25	22.5	25	16	25	25	25
3	Employment with the Firm < 1 year -0 1 year -3 Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks	5	0	0	5	0	0	0
	Total	100	88.5	91	85.73	91	90.66	91

Evaluation Sheet - Highway Maintenance cum Resident Engineer I

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	Theme	L N Malviya	Aarvee	TPF	Wdia	MSV
	General Qualification/Name/DOB	25	Mamidi V Sailesh Kumar 30-08-1972	Vivekanand Mathapati 24-04-1969	Sudhir Sahu 08-07-1979	Syed Atijaz Ahmed 27-03-1957	M.Suresh 08-08-1965	Rajkumar S 16-05-1976
	i. Graduate in Civil Engineering- 21 marks							
	ii. Post Graduation in Highway Engg.- 04 marks	25	21	21	21	21	21	21
2	Adequacy for the project	70						
Professional Experience								
i)	Experience in Highway works (inspection/ design/construction/maintenance)							
	< 7 years -0							
	7years -22	30	30	30	30	30	30	30
	Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.							
ii)	Experience in similar capacity* in highway Construction / Maintenance works of similar nature< 3 years -0	15	15	15	15	15	15	14
	3 years -12							
	Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.							
iii)	Experience in similar capacity* in project involving Construction/ Maintenance works of 4/6 laning/ Expressways	25	25	25	25	25	25	23.33
	1 project -20							
	Add 2.5 marks extra for each project to maximum 5 (five) marks.							
3	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	0	0	0	4
	< 1 year -0							
	1 year -3							
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks							
	Total	100	91	91	91	91	91	92.33

Evaluation Sheet - Highway Maintenance cum Resident Engineer I

S. No.	Description	Max. Marks	Theme	L N Malviya	Aarvee	TPF	Wdia	MSV
	General Qualification/Name/DOB	25	Digvijay Pratap Singh 12-12-1967	Dattu Shivsharan Mhaskar 01-06-1968	K. Sebastian 11-12-1976	N S Renuka Prasad 06-06-1960	K VISHWANATHAM 04-06-1960	Y Syam Kumar 06-04-1973
	i. Graduate in Civil Engineering- 21 marks	25	21	21	21	21	21	21
	ii. Post Graduation in Highway Engg.- 04 marks							
2	Adequacy for the project	70						
Professional Experience								
i)	Experience in Highway works (inspection/ design/construction/maintenance)							
	< 7 years -0	30	30	30	30	30	30	30
	7years -22							
	Add two marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.							
ii)	Experience in similar capacity* in highway Construction / Maintenance works of similar nature< 3 years -0	15	15	15	10	15	15	15
	3 years -12							
	Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 3 (three) marks.							
iii)	Experience in similar capacity* in project involving Construction/ Maintenance works of 4/6 laning/ Expressways	25	25	25	13.33	25	25	25
	1 project -20							
	Add 2.5 marks extra for each project to maximum 5 (five) marks.							
3	Employment with the Firm	5	0	0	5	4	0	0
	< 1 year -0							
	1 year -3							
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks							
	Total	100	91	91	79.33	95	91	91

Evaluation Sheet - Bridge/Structural Engineer

S.	Description		Max. Marks	Theme	L N Malviya	Aarvee	TPF	Wadia	MSV
No.	Description		Max. Marks	NVD Rao	Taranisen Naik	Kodavali Venkateswara Rao	N. Munuswamy	PEETHA NARAYANA RAO	P. RATNAM
1	General Qualification/Name/DOB		25	12-05-1974	01-05-1966	10-07-1968	10-05-1961	04-05-1971	01-07-1969
	Graduate in Civil Engineering - 21 marks								
	Post Graduation in Structural Engineering - 04 marks.		25	21	25	25	21	21	21
2	Adequacy for the project		70						
	Professional Experience								
	Total Professional Experience								
	< 7 years -0								
i)	7years -22		30	30	30	30	30	30	30
	Add two mark extra for each additional completed year subject to maximum 8(eight) marks.								
	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Bridge/Interchange/any other structures including rehabilitation								
ii)	< 3 years -0		20	20	20	20	20	20	20
	3 years -16								
	Add one marks extra for each additional completed year of experience subject to maximum 4 (four) marks.								
	Experience in similar capacity in Construction/Construction Bridge/Interchange/any other structures including rehabilitation of highway/expressway or similar project								
iii)	1 Project -16		20	20	20	20	20	19.66	18.8
	Add1 (one) mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 4 (four) mark								
	Employment with the Firm								
	< 1 year -0								
3	1 year -3		5	0	4	5	0	4	3.5
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks								
	Total		100	91	99	100	91	94.66	93.3

Evaluation Sheet - Road Safety Expert

S.					Theme	L N Malviya	Aarvee	TPF	Wadia	MSV
No.	Description			Max. Marks						
1	General Qualification/Name/DOB				20-09-1956	11-01-1973	15-03-1957	09-08-1980	23-12-1975	17-05-1984
	Graduate in Civil Engineering - 21 marks			25						
	Post-Graduation in Traffic/Transportation /Safety Engineering- 04 marks				21	21	21	25	25	25
2	Adequacy for the project			70						
Professional Experience										
i)	Total Professional Experience									
	< 7years -0									
	7years -22			30	30	30	30	30	30	30
ii)	Add two mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 8 (eight) marks.									
	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Works of Major Highway Projects (4/6 laning Projects)									
	< 3years -0									
	3years -17			20	20	20	20	20	20	20
iii)	Add one mark extra for each additional year of experience subject to maximum 3(three) marks.									
	Experience in similar capacity in Road Safety Audit of 4/6 lane highway/Expressway projects. 1 nos. -12									
	Add 1 (one) mark extra for each additional project subject to maximum 3(three) marks.			15	15	15	14.4	15	13.8	15
iv)	Experience in similar capacity in preparation of Road Safety Management Plan for Inter Urban Highways.									
	1project -3marks			5	5	5	5	5	0	5
	More than one project - 5 marks									
3	Employment with the Firm									
	< 1 year - 0									
	1 year - 3			5	3.5	4	0	0	0	0
	Add 0.5 marks for each subsequent year subject to maximum 2 marks									
	Total			100	94.5	95	90.4	95	88.8	95